# scientific reports

### OPEN

Check for updates

## Decoration of Ag nanoparticles on CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods for efficient electrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub>

Schindra Kumar Ray<sup>⊠</sup>, Rabin Dahal, Moses D. Ashie & Bishnu Prasad Bastakoti<sup>⊠</sup>

Hydrothermal and photoreduction/deposition methods were used to fabricate Aq nanoparticles (NPs) decorated CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods. Improvement of charge transfer and transportation of ions by making heterostructure was proved by cyclic voltammetry and electrochemical impedance spectroscopy measurements. Linear sweep voltammetry results revealed a fivefold enhancement of current density by fabricating heterostructure. The lowest Tafel slope (112 mV/dec) for heterostructure compared with CoMoO<sub>4</sub> (273 mV/dec) suggested the improvement of electrocatalytic performance. The electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction reaction was performed on an H-type cell. The CoMoO<sub>4</sub> electrocatalyst possessed the Faraday efficiencies (FEs) of CO and CH<sub>4</sub> up to 56.80% and 19.80%, respectively at -1.3 V versus RHE. In addition, Aq NPs decorated CoMoO<sub>4</sub> electrocatalyst showed FEs for CO,  $CH_4$ , and  $C_2H_6$  were 35.30%, 11.40%, and 44.20%, respectively, at the same potential. It is found that CO<sub>2</sub> reduction products shifted from CO/CH<sub>4</sub> to C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> when the Ag NPs deposited on the CoMoO<sub>4</sub> electrocatalyst. In addition, it demonstrated excellent electrocatalytic stability after a prolonged 25 h amperometric test at -1.3 V versus RHE. It can be attributed to a synergistic effect between the Ag NPs and CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods. This study highlights the cooperation between Ag NPs on CoMoO<sub>4</sub> components and provides new insight into the design of heterostructure as an efficient, stable catalyst towards electrocatalytic reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to CO, CH<sub>4</sub>, and C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> products.

The dramatic increase in  $CO_2$  concentration in the atmosphere leads to notable environmental issues<sup>1</sup>. So, the conversion of  $CO_2$  into valuable chemical products plays a vital role to minimize the greenhouse effect and maintain the global carbon balance that has recently attracted significant attention to researchers<sup>2–6</sup>. Among different  $CO_2$  conversion strategies, the electrochemical  $CO_2$  reduction reaction ( $CO_2RR$ ) reveals a perfect approach for usable chemicals and fuels productions<sup>7,8</sup>. The combination of carbon-based electro-fuel production from  $CO_2RR$  with renewable energy exhibits the great hope of global carbon neutrality. However, slow reaction kinetics lowers the performance of the electrocatalyst for  $CO_2RR^{9,10}$ . Therefore, fabrication of a novel electrocatalyst is urgent to solve the problems related with sluggish kinetics and high overpotential.

Ag has been regarded as a promising  $CO_2RR$  catalyst due to its relatively low overpotential, high selectivity, tendency of lowering the  $CO_2$  reduction reaction barrier, better solubility of  $CO_2$ , electron transfer, improvement of local catalytic environment, suppression of hydrogen evolution reaction (HER), and appropriate (neither too strong nor too weak) binding strength with products<sup>11–13</sup>. It is considered as a benchmark electrocatalysts for selective conversion of  $CO_2$  to CO with good Faradic efficiencies. Despite these advantages, pure Ag NPs suffer from maintaining the size/structure, high-cost, and stability due to their high level of surface energy<sup>14</sup>. So, the construction of heterostructure interface between pure metal and low-cost metal oxide materials is a perfect choice because it induces synergistic effects to promote the stability/selectivity/electrocatalytic efficiency, reduce the overpotential, and conversion of  $CO_2$  to CO, C1 and multi-carbon products<sup>10,14</sup>.

Nowadays, Ag NPs have been coupled with several metal oxides such as TiO<sub>2</sub>, CuOx, Cr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>, MnO<sub>2</sub>, SnO<sub>2</sub>, etc. for CO<sub>2</sub>RR. However, these oxide materials suffer from low conductivity and insufficient catalytic performances<sup>15–19</sup>. Also, these heterostructures cannot produce C2 ( $C_2H_6$ ) during electrocatalytic CO<sub>2</sub>RR. To solve these issues, selecting cobalt molybdate (CoMoO<sub>4</sub>) is the best metal oxide material because Co-based oxides provide excellent catalytic activities and Mo-based materials demonstrate outstanding electrical conductivity<sup>20</sup>. Also, the synergistic integration of Co and Mo improves the electrocatalytic properties of CoMoO<sub>4</sub>. In addition, it has several advantages such as stable crystal structure, redox performance, favorable physical/chemical properties, enhancement of electrolyte–electrode surface area, excellent mechanical stability, ionic conductivity, generation of active sites, small overpotential, environmentally friendly, inexpensive, and abundant resources<sup>21–25</sup>. The

Department of Chemistry, North Carolina A and T State University, 1601 E Market St, Greensboro, NC 27411, USA. <sup>22</sup>email: skray@ncat.edu; bpbastakoti@ncat.edu multiple oxidation states of cobalt involved at the intermediate state for  $CO_2RR^{26}$ . Furthermore, rods like structure or nanorods can contribute a higher contact area along with great electron pathways than other morphologies<sup>21</sup>. Although lots of paper has been published for Ag NPs towards  $CO_2RR$ , Ag NPs decorated  $CoMoO_4$  rod heterostructure has rarely been reported for  $CO_2$  reduction to CO, C1 and multi-carbon compounds.

In this study,  $Ag/CoMoO_4$  heterostructure was synthesized by hydrothermal and photoreduction/deposition methods. The hydrothermal method revealed several advantages as compared to others, such as low cost, mass efficiency, high product purity, mild preparation conditions, and simple equipment<sup>20,24,27–31</sup>. In addition, photoreduction process is simple and inexpensive and can be operated at room temperature<sup>32</sup>. The formation of heterostructure is well characterized by X-ray diffractometry (XRD), field emission scanning electron microscopy (FESEM), transmission electron microscopy (TEM), elemental mapping, X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS), Raman spectroscopy, Fourier-transform infrared spectroscopy (FTIR), and Inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectroscopy linear sweep voltammetry, and chronoamperometry) of catalysts were performed in an H-type cell for electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub>RR. Tafel plots were analyzed. The gaseous products were detected by gas chromatography (GC). The Faradic efficiencies (FEs) of CO<sub>2</sub>RR was calculated, and possible mechanisms were proposed.

#### Experimental section Materials

All chemicals consist of analytical grade. These were used without any further purification. Copper foil (CF) with 0.1 mm thickness was purchased from Merck, Germany. Molybdic acid  $(H_2MOO_4)$  and cobalt nitrate hexahydrate  $[Co(NO_3)_2.6H_2O]$ , potassium bicarbonate (KHCO<sub>3</sub>), and aqueous ammonia (aq. NH<sub>3</sub>) were used for the synthesis of samples and obtained from the Sigma-Aldrich. Silver nitrate (AgNO<sub>3</sub>) was purchased from Fisher chemical, Belgium.

#### Synthesis of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>

CoMoO<sub>4</sub> was synthesized from hydrothermal process. In this synthesis technique,  $2 \times 10^{-2}$  mol of H<sub>2</sub>MoO<sub>4</sub> was placed in 40 mL of water. In addition,  $2 \times 10^{-2}$  mol of Co(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>2</sub>·6H<sub>2</sub>O was dissolved in 40 mL of water. These were magnetically stirred until clear solution was obtained. Then, the prepared solutions were mixed dropwise by using pipette under magnetic stirring and precipitation was occurred. The pH of the solution was adjusted at pH 7 by using aqueous ammonia (NH<sub>3</sub>). It was magnetically stirred for 4 h. After that, the suspension solution was transferred into a 100 mL Teflon-lined stainless autoclave and kept at 200 °C for 4 h. After completion of hydrothermal treatment, the solution was centrifuged and washed with water and ethanol multiple times. Subsequently, it was dried in a vacuum oven at 70 °C for 8 h. The powder was obtained and calcined at 400 °C for 5 h. At last, the powder sample (CoMoO<sub>4</sub>) was grounded with the help of mortar and piston.

Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> was fabricated by hydrothermal followed by photoreduction/deposition techniques. According to this technique, hydrothermal synthesized 1 g of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> powder was taken and placed in 100 mL beaker. 80 mL ethyl alcohol ( $C_2H_5OH$ ) was put in a beaker and magnetically stirred for 2 h. 5 wt% of Ag (source: AgNO<sub>3</sub>) was placed in a beaker and magnetically stirred for 4 h under UV light irradiation. After this step, it was centrifuged and washed with water/ $C_2H_5OH$  several times. The obtained sample was dried in a vacuum oven for 70 °C for 4 h. Finally, it was grounded. The schematic illustration of material synthesis was presented in Fig. S1.

#### Material characterization

The crystal phase was determined using a powder X-ray diffractometer (Rigaku, Miniflex 600) with Cu Ka radiation ( $2\theta$ : 20 to 80°, continuous rate: 1°/minute, and step: 0.02). The morphologies of samples were investigated by field emission scanning electron microscopy (FESEM, JEOL, JSM-IT800). Transmission electron microscopy (TEM), high-resolution transmission electron microscopy (HRTEM), and selected area diffraction patterns (SAED), EDS elemental mapping images were obtained by JEOL 1230. The X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS) analysis of the samples was performed using Thermo Scientific ESCALAB<sup>\*\*</sup> XI (Al Ka and 200 eV). The Raman spectra of samples were measured on Horiba Raman confocal microscope. Fouriertransform infrared spectroscopy (FTIR) of samples were measured on IRTracer-100 (Shimadzu). Inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectroscopy (ICP-OES) was used to find the leaching of Ag NPs after performance of electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> RR by samples. It is also used to find out the metal ions in the samples. The detail explanation was provided in supporting information (Figs. S2, S3, and S4). Zeta potential of powder samples was measured by Zetasizer Nano ZS (Malvern Instruments, Malvern, UK). The powder was dispersed in 70% ethanol (15 mL) and placed in an ultrasonic bath for 1 h. The zeta potential was measured after diluting the samples with distilled water.

#### **Electrochemical characterizations**

All the electrochemical measurements were carried out on a CH Instruments with a typical three-electrode system in 0.5 M KHCO<sub>3</sub> electrolyte solution at room temperature, a platinum electrode (counter electrode), Ag/ AgCl electrode (reference electrode), and working electrodes (CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>). For the synthesis of working electrodes, 0.5 mL of  $C_2H_5OH$ , 50 µL nafion, and 4 mg of powder sample were dispersed via ultrasonic processing. As a substrate, CF (2 cm × 2 cm) was washed with water and ethanol for 60 min under ultrasonication and dried at 70 °C for 4 h in a vacuum oven. The well-dispersed ink was placed in CF via controllable drop casting. The available working area in the electrode was 1 cm<sup>2</sup>. Then, it was dried in an oven at 70 °C for 4 h.

Cyclic voltammetry (CV) with scan rate 20 to 150 mV/s of samples was measured. In addition, the electrical conductivity of the samples was performed through the electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS)

that consists of 0.1 Hz to 100,000 Hz. The linear sweep voltammetry (LSV) of the samples was observed from 0 to -0.6 V versus RHE at scan rate 10 mV/s. Tafel plots were obtained at potential -1 to 1 V. The reversible hydrogen electrode (RHE) was calculated using following equation:  $E_{RHE} = E_{Ag/AgCl} + 0.197 + 0.059$  pH (0.5 M KHCO<sub>3</sub>~8.52), where  $E_{Ag/AgCl}$  represents potential against the reference electrode and 0.197 V indicates the standard potential of Ag/AgCl at 25 °C<sup>33</sup>.

The electrochemical  $CO_2RR$  was performed on H-type cell. A 50 mL electrochemical cell was used that consists of 35 mL electrolyte. The anodic and cathodic compartments were separated by Nafion 117 membrane. This membrane was washed with acid/water before using in H-type cell. A stream of pure (99.999%)  $CO_2$  gas was continuously passed in the cell for saturation of electrolyte for 60 min at 5 sccm using mass flow controller (MC-100SCCM-D, Alicat Scientific). The gas outlet of H -type cell (cathodic compartment) was connected to a gas chromatograph (SRI 8610C). The GC is equipped with flame ionization detector (FID) for determining hydrocarbon and CO products during electrochemical  $CO_2RR$ . The carrier gas for FID is helium GC was calibrated using standard gas mixtures (ARC3) under 1 atm and 298 K. Amperometry *i-t* experiments were conducted at fixed potentials – 1.3 V versus RHE. The first injection of gas in GC was performed 400 s after the start of  $CO_2$  reduction. The different concentration of gases in ppm was noted and Faradic efficiencies were calculated on – 1.3 V versus RHE. (Supplementary information). In addition, electrocatalytic stability was evaluated for 25 h under similar applied potential. For comparison of efficiency of electrocatalyst, electrocatalytic performance of the copper foil was carried out.

#### Results and discussion

#### Characterization of synthetic materials

As shown in Fig. 1, XRD patterns of samples were well matched with monoclinic structure of pure  $\alpha$ -CoMoO<sub>4</sub> with space group C2/m (JCPDS No. 21-0868)<sup>25</sup>. After deposition of Ag NPs on CoMoO<sub>4</sub>, new crystal plane (111) was appeared that suggests the existence of cubic Ag NPs with JCPDS No. 4-0783<sup>34</sup>. In addition, the intensities of XRD peaks were slightly reduced in Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> sample. Besides, it should be noted that the peak position of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> was not shifted, which suggested no substitutional doping. No impurities diffraction peaks were found in samples. The existence of Ag and CoMoO<sub>4</sub> in Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> suggest the successful fabrication of heterostructures.

The morphologies of synthesized materials were investigated by FESEM and TEM. The samples presented rodlike morphology with dimensions of  $1-3 \mu m$  in length and  $0.3-1 \mu m$  in width (Fig. 2a and b). The existence of Ag NPs on the CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods was also observed in Fig. 2b. In addition, the loading of Ag NPs on CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods did not change the morphology of materials. Figure 2c and d presented the TEM image of Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>. This image revealed the decoration of Ag NPs on the surface of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods. It also indicates the uniform distribution of Ag NPs on rods. The interplanar spacing of 0.33 nm and 0.23 nm calculated from Fig. 2e were corresponds to the (002) and (111) crystal planes of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag, respectively which are also strongest peak in the XRD spectrum. All the interplanar spacing calculated from HRTEM image are well consistent with crystallographic plane of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag. SAED patterns suggested the poly-crystalline nature of Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> (Fig. 2f). As shown in Figs. 2g-k and S5, the TEM-EDS mapping/spectrum of Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> indicated the existence as well as homogenous distribution of Co, Mo, O, and Ag (Table S1). According to the results of XRD, FESEM, TEM, HRTEM, SAED, and TEM-EDS elemental mapping images, it was concluded that the heterostructure was successfully formed between CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag NPs.

The existence of elements and oxidation states in  $CoMoO_4$  and  $Ag/CoMoO_4$  were investigated using XPS technique (Fig. 3). The Co 2p spectra of samples could be deconvoluted into  $2p_{3/2}$ , (CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 781.12 eV and



Figure 1. XRD analysis of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> samples.



**Figure 2.** FESEM of (a) CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and (b) Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>), (c and d) TEM, (e) HRTEM, (f) SAED pattern, (g-k) TEM elemental mapping (g: EDS layered image, h: Ag, i: Co, j: Mo, and k: O) images of Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>. Scale bar (a: 1  $\mu$ m, b: 0.5  $\mu$ m, c: 500 nm, d: 50 nm, e: 10 nm, f: 5 nm<sup>-1</sup>, and g-k: 200 nm).



**Figure 3.** XPS spectra of  $CoMoO_4$  (**a**-**d**) and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> (**e**-**i**).

Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 779. 91 eV), satellite  $2p_{3/2}$  (CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 785.49 eV and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 784.29 eV),  $2p_{1/2}$ , (CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 797.12 eV and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 795.94 eV) and satellite  $2p_{1/2}$  (CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 802.94 eV and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 801.60 eV) peaks that suggests the Co<sup>2+</sup> oxidation state in samples (Fig. 3a and e)<sup>35</sup>. The Mo 3d spectra were fitted into two peaks  $3d_{5/2}$  (CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 232.02 eV and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 231.27 eV) and  $3d_{3/2}$  (CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 235.13 eV and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 234.38 eV). It clearly shows the presence of Mo<sup>6+</sup> in samples (Fig. 3b and f)<sup>36</sup>. In addition, 0.75 eV and 1.2 eV shift of the binding energy were observed in Mo 3d and Co 2p peaks, respectively. It suggests the evidence for interaction between the CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 529.20 eV) and oxygen vacancies (CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 531.30 eV and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub>: 531.30 eV) or defects were observed (Fig. 3c and g)<sup>38</sup>. As shown in Fig. 3h, the presence of metallic Ag NPs in Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> was proved by  $3d_{5/2}$  and  $3d_{3/2}$  peaks at 366.83 eV and 372.80 eV, respectively<sup>39</sup>. Furthermore, the survey spectra suggested the confirmation of Co, Mo, on and Ag in samples (Fig. 3c and g). Also, the results of ICP-OES indicated the presence of metallic ions (Co, Mo, and Ag) in samples (Supporting information). To find the surface charge in samples, the zeta potential of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> was evaluated. The zeta potential of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> was evaluated. The zeta potential of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> was enaluated.

Raman spectra of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> was shown in Fig. S6. The vibrational modes were found at 926, 869, 808.70, and 355.61 cm<sup>-1</sup>. The Raman mode located at 926.51 cm<sup>-1</sup> was associated with symmetric stretching mode of doubly coordinated bridging oxygen in Mo–O<sup>40</sup>. The band at 869.20 cm<sup>-1</sup> was related to the symmetric stretching of Co–O–Mo bond. In addition, the band observed at 808.08 cm<sup>-1</sup> can be attributed to the asymmetric stretching mode of oxygen in O–Mo–O<sup>41</sup>. The symmetry bending modes of O–Mo–O was observed at 355.61 cm<sup>-142</sup>. The decoration of Ag NPs on CoMoO<sub>4</sub> did not alter the Raman bands that suggest the fabrication of heterojunction between Ag NPs and CoMoO<sub>4</sub>. Furthermore, FTIR studies were performed of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> : 632.96 cm<sup>-1</sup>) was associated with Co–Mo–O stretching vibrations<sup>43</sup>. The peaks appeared in CoMoO<sub>4</sub> (779.75, 832.78, and 926.54 cm<sup>-1</sup>) and Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> (779.76, 846.01, and 933.40 cm<sup>-1</sup>) were assigned to Mo–O stretching bands<sup>44</sup>. These bands provided the evidence of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> in samples.

#### Electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction

As shown in Fig. 4a and b, CV curves of  $CoMoO_4$  and  $Ag/CoMoO_4$  nanorods were recorded in a potential window of -0.6 to 0.6 V at different sweeping rates (20 mV/s, 40 mV/s, 60 mV/s, 80 mV/s, 100 mV/s, and 150 mV/s). The observed redox peaks may be attributed to reversibly changing their oxidation states of  $Co^{2+}$  and  $Co^{3+45}$ . These redox peaks were obtained from redox mechanism that reveals the Faradic capacitive behavior of the  $CoMoO_4$  and  $Ag/CoMoO_4$  electrodes. In addition, the enhancement of conductivity by molybdenum (Mo) can improve the electrochemical performances of electrodes<sup>28</sup>. Also, an increase in sweep rate provided the shifting of the oxidation and reduction peaks of electrodes towards right and left, respectively due to higher internal diffusion resistance. The CV curve area and current increased with increase in scan rate because of



Figure 4. CV (a:  $CoMoO_4$ , (b) Ag/CoMoO\_4, and (c) comparison of  $CoMoO_4$  and Ag/CoMoO\_4) and EIS (d) of samples.

fast reaction kinetics<sup>27,46</sup>. The shape of CV peaks did not change at high scan rate that suggests the good rate performance of catalyst.

As depicted in Fig. 4c, compared with  $CoMoO_4$  electrode, the increased loop of CV curves was observed for Ag/CoMoO\_4 electrodes. In addition, presence of Ag NPs in  $CoMoO_4$  enhanced the reduction ability. These factor indicate the improvement of charge transfer and transportation of ions by making heterostructure between Ag NPs and  $CoMoO_4$ . So, the fabrication of heterojunction between Ag NPs and  $CoMoO_4$  rods enhanced the electrocatalytic performance which is beneficial for  $CO_2$  reduction. To observe the effect of Cu-foil in fabricated electrodes, CV curve of Cu-foil was carried out (Fig. S8). It demonstrates the negligible current as compared to  $CoMoO_4$  and Ag/CoMoO\_4 CV curves. Also, insignificant contribution of Cu-foil was noted. Also, EIS was measured to observe the interfacial charge transfer on catalysts (Fig. 4d)<sup>47</sup>. The obtained data was fitted, and equivalent circuit was made (Fig. S9). It was composed of solution resistance (R1), charge transfer resistance (R2), electric double layer capacitance (C2), Warburg impedance, and constant phase element (Q). According to the Nyquist plots, Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> (41.57  $\Omega$ ) demonstrated lower charge transfer resistance in comparison to  $CoMoO_4$  (309.50  $\Omega$ ) suggesting its rapid electron transfer between the interface of electrolyte and electrocatalyst that may allow efficient electron, Ag NPs and  $CoMoO_4$  interactions (Table S2). Therefore, decoration of Ag NPs on  $CoMoO_4$  rods could promote the electron transportation between the electrocatalyst and  $CO_2$  molecules that provides the electrochemical reduction capability of heterostructure.

The accelerated  $CO_2RR$  conversion kinetics upon the heterostructure was further conformed by Tafel plots (Fig. 5a). The Tafel slope for  $COMOO_4$  and  $Ag/COMOO_4$  were estimated to be 273 mV/dec and 112 mV/dec, respectively. The lowest Tafel slope for  $Ag/COMOO_4$  suggests the enhancement of electrocatalytic activity by fabricating heterostructure between Ag NPs and  $COMOO_4$  because of rapid electron transfer from the electrode to electrocatalyst. This result also indicates that the transfer of first electron to adsorbed  $CO_2$  molecules. It facilitates the production  $*CO_2$  that can improve a second electron-transfer for \*COOH generation<sup>48</sup>. To compare the electrochemical performance of Ag NPs with other non-precious metal particles, Tafel slope was evaluated (Fig. S10). Ag NPs showed lower Tafel slope than Cu indicating great electrochemical performance of Ag NPs that is accordance to published report<sup>49</sup>. Furthermore, the  $CO_2RR$  performance of the as-synthesized electrocatalyst was investigated by LSV graphs (Fig. 5c and d). Ag/CoMOO<sub>4</sub> revealed higher current density than CoMOO<sub>4</sub> at -0.6 V. Ag NPs decorated CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods showed approximately fivefold enhancement of current density in comparison with CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods (Fig. 5b). The current density of samples along with CO<sub>2</sub>-saturated 0.1 M KHCO<sub>3</sub> electrolyte suggest demonstrated higher current density suggesting better reactivity in CO<sub>2</sub>RR (Fig. 5c).

Steady-state current responses in a CO<sub>2</sub>-saturated electrolyte for 400 s at -1.3 V versus RHE of samples were presented in Fig. S11. The obtained current densities for COMOO<sub>4</sub> and Ag/COMOO<sub>4</sub> were -3.35 mA and -4.62 mA, respectively. After that, the gas-phase products were detected by using a GC (Table S3). The FEs for various gas formation of COMOO<sub>4</sub> and Ag/COMOO<sub>4</sub> were calculated (Supporting Information)<sup>33</sup>. According to Fig. 5d, COMOO<sub>4</sub> presented FEs for CO and CH<sub>4</sub> were 56.80% and 19.80%, respectively. In this case, CO and CH<sub>4</sub> act as a major and minor gaseous products during CO<sub>2</sub>RR, respectively. In addition, Ag/COMOO<sub>4</sub> revealed FEs for CO and CH<sub>4</sub>, were 35.30%, 11.40%, and 44.20%, respectively. It was noted that loading of Ag





Scientific Reports | (2024) 14:1406 |

NPs on CoMoO<sub>4</sub> reduces the FEs for CO and CH<sub>4</sub>, and C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub>. These results clearly indicate that C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> is a major product in Ag NPs decorated CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods. In addition, electrocatalytic stability of cu-foil was evaluated after a 400 s amperometric test at -1.3 V versus RHE (Fig. S12). Low current density along with unstable nature were observed. It suggests the Cu-foil did not contribute the significantly for steady-state current responses. Stability curves of Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> at -1.3 V versus RHE was shown in Fig. S13. Notably, the electrocatalyst exhibited outstanding stability even upto 25 h. Also, the current density was not changed during stability. ICP-OES analysis of electrolyte solution revealed no leaching of Ag ions after 25 h stability test. Table 1 revealed the comparison of FEs of various Ag-based electrocatalysts with Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub><sup>16-19,34,48,50,51</sup>. This Table suggests the fabrication of various morphologies of Ag and Ag-based heterostructure by several techniques for electrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to CO and C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> under different applied potential. Although several gaseous products were found on Ag-based electrocatalystic reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> into C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> by using Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> heterostructure has not yet been reported in the literature.

Based on the above results, the possible reaction mechanisms/pathways were purposed. In  $CoMOQ_4$ , Co consists of loosely bonded d-electrons that provides the multiple oxidation state. Moreover, transition of Co (II) to Co (I) is considered as an intermediate state for CO<sub>2</sub> reduction<sup>26</sup>. At first, Co<sup>2+</sup> is reduced to Co<sup>+</sup> under the applied potential. When CO<sub>2</sub> is adsorbed on the (002) catalyst surface, oxidation of Co<sup>+</sup> to Co<sup>2+</sup> is occurred. Due to this reason, electron is transferred to the adsorbed CO<sub>2</sub> and stabilization of CO<sub>2</sub> radical is happened. Also, the presence of oxygen vacancy in catalyst can improve the stabilization of CO<sub>2</sub> radical<sup>15</sup>. After that, CO<sub>2</sub> radical has ability to capture the proton (H<sup>+</sup>) and electron (e<sup>-</sup>) that may dissociate from HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>--</sup> ion to produce COOH<sup>+</sup> intermediate because of small potential obstacles. Then, this intermediate reacted with H<sup>+</sup>/e<sup>-</sup> continuously to generate CO molecule. The possible reasons for formation of CO as a major product is related with existence of  $\pi$ -back donation between the center of Co metal and CO<sub>2</sub> ligand that can enhance the C-O cleavage<sup>52</sup>. Furthermore, \*CO may transform into \*CHO via hydrogenation<sup>53</sup>. The stabilization of \*CHO intermediate play significant role for mitigating the overpotential for CH<sub>4</sub> production. This \*CHO intermediate may convert into \*CH<sub>2</sub>O and \*CH<sub>3</sub>O during transfer of H<sup>+</sup>/e<sup>-</sup> during CO<sub>2</sub>RR. Finally, \*CH<sub>3</sub>O intermediate transforms into CH<sub>4</sub><sup>53,54</sup>.

The decoration of Ag NPs (111) on the surface of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rod may reduce the energy barrier for conversion of CO<sub>2</sub> to CO, CH<sub>4</sub> and C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> products that can change the reactions pathways. C–C coupling mechanism plays a vital role to achieve the high selectivity of C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> species. The possible reason for generation of C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> species may associate with existence of active sites in catalyst. According to this mechanism, \*CO dimerization process is occurred at the catalyst surface<sup>53,55</sup>. The double bond between the C and O is broken and proton can attack the O site to form -OH during reaction with H<sup>+</sup>/e<sup>-</sup>. In addition, -OH functional group is eliminated with the reaction with proton to produce H<sub>2</sub>O. Due to this reaction, double bonds are created between C to C and C to O. After transfer of two H<sup>+</sup>/e<sup>-</sup>, 2H<sup>+</sup> react with carbon to form HC=CH along with attachment of O on the surface of catalyst. Then, H<sup>+</sup> may react with double bond containing C to form single bond between carbon along with attachment of O with surface and -CH<sub>2</sub>. At last, surface attached O reacts with H<sup>+</sup> to form H<sub>2</sub>O and C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> is produced. The possible reason for obtaining the higher FEs of C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> than CO and CH<sub>4</sub> for Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> may associate with higher chance of protonation (\*CO → \*COH) than desorption of \*CO on interface<sup>56</sup>. Also, decrease in FEs for CO and CH<sub>4</sub> of Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> than COMoO<sub>4</sub> could be related with covering the Ag NPs on CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods. The synergistic effect between Ag NPs and CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods can be attributed to generate the CO, CH<sub>4</sub> and C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub>.

#### Conclusion

Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> electrocatalyst was prepared through hydrothermal and photoreduction/deposition methods. The existence of heterostructure between Ag NPs and CoMoO<sub>4</sub> rods was shown by structural and physicochemical characterization techniques. The excellent electrochemical behaviors of catalysts were proved by CV, EIS, LSV, chronoamperometry, and Tafel plots. The electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub>RR of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> favored for CO (FEs: 56.80) and CH<sub>4</sub> (FEs: 19.80) at -1.3 V versus RHE in a H-type cell containing 0.5 M KHCO<sub>3</sub>. However, the heterostructure revealed selectivity for reducing mainly CO<sub>2</sub> to C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> (FEs: 56.80) along with lower FEs for CO and CH<sub>4</sub> at same condition. The selectivity for reducing CO<sub>2</sub> to CO, CH<sub>4</sub>, and C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>6</sub> by electrocatalyst was attributed to adequate

Catalyst	Synthesis methods	Morphology	FEs	Potential (V vs. RHE/SCE)	References
Ag-Au	Self-assembly	Nanowires/nanosheet	99.0% (CO)	-0.9	50
Ag	Chemical/photoreduction	Triangular/nanoplates	96.0% (CO)	-0.856	51
Ag@ZnO@rGO	Hydrothermal/functionalization	Dodecahedral	70.0% (CO)	-1.6	34
Ag/CuO	Hydrothermal and impregnation	Nanosphere	40.0% (C <sub>2</sub> H <sub>4</sub> )	-1.1	48
Ag/CuO	Solution-phase	Nanosheet	91.2% (CO)	-0.7	16
Ag/Cr <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub>	Electrochemical	Hexagon	99.6% (CO)	-0.8	17
Ag/SnO <sub>2</sub>	Oil bath	Sphere	99.2%(CO)	-0.9	18
Ag/MOx (M=Cr, Sn, Bi, Cu, Pb, and Mn)	Reduction	Dendritic	98.0% (CO)	-0.7	19
Ag/CoMoO <sub>4</sub>	Hydrothermal and photoreduction	Rods and nanoparticles	35.30% (CO), 11.40% (CH <sub>4</sub> ), and 44.20% (C <sub>2</sub> H <sub>6</sub> )	-1.3	Our work

### **Table 1.** The comparison of the electrochemical $CO_2RR$ results of this work with other Ag-based electrocatalysts.

active sites, oxygen vacancies, and excellent conductivities. In addition, the synergistic effect of Ag-CoMoO<sub>4</sub> active sites provided the C–C coupling for reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to  $C_2H_6$  electrocatalytically. The electrocatalyst showed excellent stability upto 25 h without reduction of current density that can be applied for practical application towards electrocatalytic CO<sub>2</sub> reduction. The possible mechanisms/pathways were proposed for CO<sub>2</sub>RR. Finally, the outcomes of this work present a new approach for improving electrochemical performances/reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to CO and hydrocarbon by using the Ag/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> heterostructure catalyst.

#### Data availability

The data generated or analysed during this study are available within the article and its supplementary material. Raw data of cyclic voltammetry, Electrochemical Impedance, Faradaic Efficiency, IT curves, LSV plot, Tafel plot, Raman, XPS and XRD spectra are provided in supplementary material (Raw data). All other data is available from the corresponding author upon request.

Received: 2 September 2023; Accepted: 8 January 2024 Published online: 16 January 2024

#### References

- 1. Wu, J., Huang, Y., Ye, W. & Li, Y. CO<sub>2</sub> reduction: From the electrochemical to photochemical approach. Adv. Sci. 4, 1–29 (2017).
- Nitopi, S. et al. Progress and perspectives of electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction on copper in aqueous electrolyte. Chem. Rev. 119, 7610-7672 (2019).
- Poon, K. C., Wan, W. Y., Su, H. & Sato, H. A review on recent advances in the electrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to CO with nanoelectrocatalysts. RSC Adv. 12, 22703–22721 (2022).
- Ejaz, M., Mohamed, M. G. & Kuo, S. W. Solid state chemical transformation provides a fully benzoxazine-linked porous organic polymer displaying enhanced CO<sub>2</sub> capture and supercapacitor performance. *Polym. Chem.* 14, 2494–2509 (2023).
- Singh, P. & Srivastava, R. Utilization of bio-inspired catalyst for CO<sub>2</sub> reduction into green fuels: Recent advancement and future perspectives. J. CO2 Util. 53, 101748 (2021).
- Qin, X., Hansen, H. A., Honkala, K. & Melander, M. M. Cation-induced changes in the inner- and outer-sphere mechanisms of electrocatalytic CO<sub>2</sub> reduction. *Nat. Commun.* 14, 7607 (2023).
- Hsu, C. S. et al. Activating dynamic atomic-configuration for single-site electrocatalyst in electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction. Nat. Commun. 14, 1–14 (2023).
- Sui, R. et al. Engineering Ag-Nx single-atom sites on porous concave N-doped carbon for boosting CO<sub>2</sub> electroreduction. ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces 13, 17736–17744 (2021).
- Sun, Z., Ma, T., Tao, H., Fan, Q. & Han, B. Fundamentals and challenges of electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction using two-dimensional materials. *Chem* 3, 560–587 (2017).
- Qin, Q., Sun, M., Wu, G. & Dai, L. Emerging of heterostructured materials in CO<sub>2</sub> electroreduction: A perspective. *Carbon Capture Sci. Technol.* 3, 100043 (2022).
- 11. Mahyoub, S. A. *et al.* An overview on the recent developments of Ag-based electrodes in the electrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to CO. *Sustain. Energy Fuels* **4**, 50–67 (2019).
- Zhu, D. D., Liu, J. L. & Qiao, S. Z. Recent advances in inorganic heterogeneous electrocatalysts for reduction of carbon dioxide. *Adv. Mater.* 28, 3423–3452 (2016).
- Frisch, M. L. *et al.* Unraveling the synergistic effects of Cu-Ag tandem catalysts during electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction using nanofocused X-ray probes. *Nat. Commun.* 14, 1–9 (2023).
- Yang, H. et al. Design and synthesis of Ag-based catalysts for electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction: Advances and perspectives. Chem. Asian J. 17, 1–14 (2022).
- Ma, S., Lan, Y., Perez, G. M. J., Moniri, S. & Kenis, P. J. A. Silver supported on titania as an active catalyst for electrochemical carbon dioxide reduction. *ChemSusChem* 7, 866–874 (2014).
- Zhang, W., Zhu, N., Ding, L., Hu, Y. & Wu, Z. Efficacious CO<sub>2</sub> adsorption and activation on Ag nanoparticles/CuO mesoporous nanosheets heterostructure for CO<sub>2</sub> electroreduction to CO. *Inorg. Chem.* 60, 19356–19364 (2021).
- Fu, H. Q. et al. Synergistic Cr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>@Ag heterostructure enhanced electrocatalytic CO<sub>2</sub> reduction to CO. Adv. Mater. 34, 2202854 (2022).
- Li, M., Hu, Y., Wang, D. & Geng, D. Enhanced electrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to CO on Ag/SnO<sub>2</sub> by a synergistic effect of morphology and structural defects. *Chem. Asian J.* 16, 2694–2701 (2021).
- Yuan, X. et al. Interface engineering of silver-based heterostructures for CO<sub>2</sub> reduction reaction. ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces 12, 56642–56649 (2020).
- 20. Zhang, Y. *et al.* Structural evolution of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> to CoOOH by ion electrochemical etching for boosting oxygen evolution reaction. *J. Power Sources* **442**, 227252 (2019).
- Alsadat Mohammadi, M., Arvand, M. & Daneshvar, S. Facile stepwise hydrothermal synthesis of hierarchical CoMoO<sub>4</sub>/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> core/shell dandelion-like nanoarrays: A promising binder-free positive electrode for high-performance asymmetric supercapacitors. J. Electroanal. Chem. **904**, 115934 (2022).
- 22. Ray, S. K. & Hur, J. A review on monoclinic metal molybdate photocatalyst for environmental remediation. J. Ind. Eng. Chem. 101, 28–50 (2021).
- 23. Zhang, L. et al. Fabrication of metal molybdate micro/nanomaterials for electrochemical energy storage. Small 13, 1–19 (2017).
- You, N. *et al.* Constructing P-CoMoO<sub>4</sub>@NiCoP heterostructure nanoarrays on Ni foam as efficient bifunctional electrocatalysts for overall water splitting. *Nano Mater. Sci.* https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nanoms.2021.05.004 (2021).
- Jiao, F. *et al.* Regulating the electronic structure of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> microrod by phosphorus doping: An efficient electrocatalyst for the hydrogen evolution reaction. *Dalt. Trans.* 49, 13152–13159 (2020).
- Usman, M. et al. Electrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub>: A review of cobalt based catalysts for carbon dioxide conversion to fuels. Nanomaterials 11, 1–27 (2021).
- Liang, R. et al. High performance g-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> @NiMoO<sub>4</sub>/CoMoO<sub>4</sub> electrode for supercapacitors. J. Solid State Chem. 307, 122845 (2022).
- Mao, X. et al. Core-shell structured CuCo<sub>2</sub>S<sub>4</sub>@CoMoO<sub>4</sub> nanorods for advanced electrode materials. J. Alloys Compd. 844, 156133 (2020).
- 29. Lakhlifi, H. *et al.* Nanocrystalline transition metal (CoMoO<sub>4</sub>) prepared by sol gel method: Correlation between powder colors and  $\alpha/\beta$  phase transformations. *Inorg. Chem. Commun.* 145, 110049 (2022).
- Adeleye, A. T., John, K. I., Adeleye, P. G., Akande, A. A. & Banjoko, O. O. One-dimensional titanate nanotube materials: Heterogeneous solid catalysts for sustainable synthesis of biofuel precursors/value-added chemicals—a review. J. Mater. Sci. 56, 18391–18416 (2021).

- Mohan, S., Vellakkat, M., Aravind, A. & Reka, U. Hydrothermal synthesis and characterization of Zinc Oxide nanoparticles of various shapes under different reaction conditions. *Nano Express* 1, 030028 (2020).
- 32. Jara, N. et al. Photochemical synthesis of gold and silver nanoparticles-a review. Molecules 26, 1-24 (2021).
- Chen, C. S. et al. Stable and selective electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide to ethylene on copper mesocrystals. Catal. Sci. Technol. 5, 161–168 (2015).
- Nguyen, V. H. *et al.* Ag@ZnO porous nanoparticle wrapped by rGO for the effective CO<sub>2</sub> electrochemical reduction. *Chem. Eng. Sci.* 232, 116381 (2021).
- Wen, Y., Li, C. X., Wang, J., Qian, Y. Y. & Shen, F. C. Hierarchically self-supporting phosphorus-doped CoMoO<sub>4</sub> nanoflowers arrays toward efficient hydrogen evolution reaction. ACS Appl. Energy Mater. 5, 6814–6822 (2022).
- Kumar Ray, S. et al. A magnetically separable α-NiMOQ<sub>4</sub>/ZnFe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/coffee biochar heterojunction photocatalyst for efficient ketoprofen degradation. Chem. Eng. J. 452, 139546 (2023).
- Guo, D. et al. Boosting the capacitive performance of hierarchical cobalt molybdate hybrid electrodes for asymmetric supercapacitors. J. Mater. Sci. 56, 10965–10978 (2021).
- 38. Ray, S. K., Dhakal, D. & Lee, S. W. Insight into malachite green degradation, mechanism and pathways by morphology-tuned α-NiMoO<sub>4</sub> photocatalyst. *Photochem. Photobiol.* **94**, 552–563 (2018).
- 39. Ray, S. K. *et al.* Transformation of tetracycline in water during degradation by visible light driven Ag nanoparticles decorated  $\alpha$ -NiMoO<sub>4</sub> nanorods: Mechanism and pathways. *Chem. Eng. J.* **373**, 259–274 (2019).
- de Moura, A. P. et al. Photoluminescent properties of CoMoO<sub>4</sub> nanorods quickly synthesized and annealed in a domestic microwave oven. Adv. Chem. Eng. Sci. 02, 465–473 (2012).
- 41. Liu, F. *et al.* Multi-dimensional CuO nanorods supported CoMoO<sub>4</sub> nanosheets heterostructure as binder free and high stable electrode for supercapacitor. *J. Mater. Sci. Mater. Electron.* **29**, 10353–10361 (2018).
- Fang, L. et al. Hierarchical CoMoO<sub>4</sub> nanoneedle electrodes for advanced supercapacitors and electrocatalytic oxygen evolution. Electrochim. Acta 259, 552–558 (2018).
- Tantraviwat, D. et al. Structural properties of tungsten-doped cobalt molybdate and its application in electrochemical oxygen evolution reaction. J. Mater. Sci. Mater. Electron. 29, 13103–13111 (2018).
- 44. Harichandran, G., Radha, S., Yesuraj, J. & Muthuraaman, B. Synthesis and characterization of cobalt molybdate dihydrate nanorods arrays for supercapacitor electrode application. *Appl. Phys. A Mater. Sci. Process.* **127**, 1–8 (2021).
- Gopi, C. V. V. M. *et al.* Facile synthesis of hierarchical flower-like NiMoO<sub>4</sub>-CoMoO<sub>4</sub> nanosheet arrays on nickel foam as an efficient electrode for high rate hybrid supercapacitors. *J. Energy Storage* **30**, 101550 (2020).
- 46. Elgrishi, N. et al. A practical beginner's guide to cyclic voltammetry. J. Chem. Educ. 95, 197-206 (2018).
- Ray, S. K., Pant, B., Park, M., Hur, J. & Lee, S. W. Cavity-like hierarchical architecture of WS<sub>2</sub>/α-NiMoO<sub>4</sub> electrodes for supercapacitor application. *Ceram. Int.* 46, 19022–19027 (2020).
- Xue, L. et al. Ultralow Ag-assisted carbon-carbon coupling mechanism on Cu-based catalysts for electrocatalytic CO<sub>2</sub> reduction. J. Energy Chem. 82, 414–422 (2023).
- Choi, J. et al. Electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction to CO on dendritic Ag-Cu electrocatalysts prepared by electrodeposition. Chem. Eng. J. 299, 37–44 (2016).
- Sang, J. L. et al. Nanoarchitectonics of 2D-thin and porous Ag-Au nanostructures with controllable alloying degrees toward electrocatalytic CO<sub>2</sub> reduction. J. Alloys Compd. 944, 169155 (2023).
- 51. Liu, S. *et al.* Shape-dependent electrocatalytic reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to CO on triangular silver nanoplates. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* **139**, 2160–2163 (2017).
- 52. Li, C. et al. Carbon dioxide photo/electroreduction with cobalt. J. Mater. Chem. A 7, 16622-16642 (2019).
- Pei, Y., Zhong, H. & Jin, F. A brief review of electrocatalytic reduction of CO<sub>2</sub>—Materials, reaction conditions, and devices. *Energy Sci. Eng.* 9, 1012–1032 (2021).
- Xue, L. *et al.* Unveiling the reaction pathway on Cu/CeO<sub>2</sub> catalyst for electrocatalytic CO2 reduction to CH4. *Appl. Catal. B Environ.* 304, 120951 (2022).
- 55. Fan, Q. *et al.* Electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction to C<sub>2+</sub> species: Heterogeneous electrocatalysts, reaction pathways, and optimization strategies. *Mater. Today Energy* **10**, 280–301 (2018).
- Shao, B. *et al.* Low-potential-driven electrocatalytic reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to hydrocarbons by cobalt-based metal-organic nanosheets. *J. Catal.* 413, 168–175 (2022).

#### Acknowledgements

This research was supported by National Science Foundation Excellence in Research Award (2100710) USA. The samples were characterized in the Joint School of Nanoscience and Nanoengineering, a member of the Southeastern Nanotechnology Infrastructure Corridor and National Nanotechnology Coordinated Infrastructure, which is supported by the National Science Foundation (Grant ECCS-1542174). The authors would like to express their gratitude to Dr. Kiran Subedi and the Analytical Services Laboratory (ASL) at CAES (College of Agriculture and Environmental Sciences) for their assistance with elemental analysis.

#### Author contributions

S.K.R. did experiment and wrote manuscript. R.D. and M.D.A. contribute in materials characterization and revision of the manuscript. B.P.B. supervised the project and revised the manuscript. All authors reviewed the manuscript.

#### **Competing interests**

The authors declare no competing interests.

#### Additional information

**Supplementary Information** The online version contains supplementary material available at https://doi.org/ 10.1038/s41598-024-51680-w.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to S.K.R. or B.P.B.

Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints.

**Publisher's note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

**Open Access** This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

© The Author(s) 2024