Check for updates

# scientific reports

MATTERS ARISING

## **OPEN** Role of ambient humidity underestimated in research on correlation between radioactive decay rates and space weather

S. Pommé 🔍 & K. Pelczar

ARISING FROM: V. Milián-Sánchez et al.; Scientific Reports https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-64497-0 (2020).

In recent work, Milián-Sánchez et al.<sup>1-3</sup> observed fluctuations in radioactive decay rate measurement series, and after excluding environmental influences (measured indoors) as root causes, they looked for possible correlations with astrophysical variables. They reported positive or negative correlations with geomagnetic activity (GMA) and cosmic-ray activity (CRA). This assertion is at variance with the most accurate measurements of radioactivity, which support the validity of the exponential-decay law<sup>4-14</sup>. If a causal relationship between 'space weather' and radioactive decay rates were true, it would invalidate the notion of invariable decay constants and have unforeseeable practical and theoretical implications.

In spite of the authors' efforts to investigate possible influences of environmental parameters—such as ambient temperature, pressure and humidity—on the detectors' stability, it turns out that the influence of ambient humidity on the instrumentation has been underestimated. In Fig. 1, the measured decay rates of a <sup>226</sup>Ra source with a Geiger-Müller counter<sup>1,3</sup> is shown together with measured ambient humidity data in a weather station in the Valencia region<sup>15</sup>. There appears to be a positive correlation between the humidity and the observed decay rates. This is even more striking when applying a toy physical model in which the humidity data are accumulated as moisture in the set-up<sup>16</sup>, shown as a line overlaid on the decay rates in Fig. 1.

The moisture accumulation model was devised in a simple manner: The relative air humidity data series,  $H_R(t)$ , sequenced in steps of half an hour, was summed (starting from at least one day before the decay rate measurements) and a convenient medium value  $\overline{H}_R$  was subtracted to realign the baseline

$$H_C(t) = \sum_{t' < t - \Delta t} \left( H_R(t') - \overline{H}_R \right)$$

No hard claims are made about the physical rigour of this toy model, but it allows to smooth out the humidity data in time (by accumulation), to adjust the baseline (by adapting  $\overline{H}_R$  to preceding conditions) and to perform a time shift (by changing  $\Delta t$ ) to align the accumulated humidity with the activity measurements and counteract a possible difference in time base between both data sets.

The moisture model has also been applied to the other decay rate measurements, the background measurements, as well as the additional tests performed on the capacitance of the detector cable and a reference capacitance<sup>16</sup>. On a qualitative level, positive correlations were observed in every case. Six graphs covering a measurement period of at least 1.9 days and showing distinct variations with time have on average a correlation factor of 0.60 (ranging between 0.35 and 0.8) with the humidity model (Figure 2). It seems fair to conclude that ambient humidity, or correlated weather conditions (such as temperature), must have played a significant role in the measurements in spite of measures taken to exclude such interferences. Consequently, the measurement data do not reflect physical changes in the decay constants caused by 'space weather', but a difference in response of the electronics to changing 'terrestrial weather' conditions.

In conclusion, the work in Refs.<sup>1-3</sup> may be regarded as exploratory research, and the sought-after correlation with space weather as highly speculative. With the discovery of hitherto unnoticed correlations with terrestrial weather conditions, the hypothesised causal correlation between space weather and radioactive decay turns out to be unsubstantiated by evidence and remains unlikely to be true.

European Commission, Joint Research Centre (JRC), Geel, Belgium. Zemail: stefaan.pomme@ec.europa.eu



**Figure 1.** Relative humidity in the Valencia region (top) in the period 5–9 Dec 2014<sup>11</sup>. Qualitative comparison (bottom) of measured <sup>226</sup>Ra decay rates<sup>1–3</sup> with a simple moisture accumulation model<sup>12</sup>.

Time interval	Measured	Correlation	Graph
5-9 Dec 2014	<sup>226</sup> Ra	0.68	A Manager and the second se
7-9 Jan 2015	<sup>226</sup> Ra	0.59	
27 Feb-1 Mar 2015	<sup>226</sup> Ra	0.52	HA HA HAHAHAHAHAHAHAHAHAHAHAHAHAHAHAHAH
22-27 Apr 2015	<sup>226</sup> Ra	0.35	
3-9 Feb 2015	<sup>90</sup> Sr/ <sup>90</sup> Y	0.66	
12 Mar - 14 Apr 2015	capacitance	0.80	Andrew

Figure 2. Six examples of decay rate/capacitance measurements compared to the humidity model<sup>16</sup>.

Received: 19 November 2020; Accepted: 25 January 2022 Published online: 15 February 2022

#### References

- Milián-Sánchez, V., Mocholí-Salcedo, A., Milián, C., Kolombet, V. A. & Verdú, G. Anomalous effects on radiation detectors and capacitance measurements inside a modified Faraday cage. Nucl. Instrum. Methods A 828, 210–228 (2016).
- 2. Scholkmann, F. *et al.* Anomalous effects of radioactive decay rates and capacitance values measured inside a modified Faraday cage: Correlations with space weather. *Europhys. Lett.* **117**, 62002 (2017).
- 3. Milián-Sánchez, V. et al. Fluctuations in measured radioactive decay rates inside a modified Faraday cage: Correlations with space weather. Sci. Rep. 10, 8525 (2020).
- 4. Pommé, S. et al. Evidence against solar influence on nuclear decay constants. Phys. Lett. B 761, 281-286 (2016).
- 5. Pommé, S. et al. On decay constants and orbital distance to the Sun-Part I: Alpha decay. Metrologia 54, 1-18 (2017).
- 6. Pommé, S. et al. On decay constants and orbital distance to the Sun—Part II: Beta minus decay. Metrologia 54, 19–35 (2017).
- 7. Pommé, S. *et al.* On decay constants and orbital distance to the Sun—Part III: Beta plus and electron capture decay. *Metrologia* 54, 36–50 (2017).
- 8. Pommé, S. et al. Is decay constant?. Appl. Radiat. Isot. 134, 6-12 (2017).
- Pommé, S., Kossert, K. & Nähle, O. On the claim of modulations in <sup>36</sup>Cl beta decay and their association with solar rotation. Sol. Phys. 292, 162 (2017).
- Pommé, S., Lutter, G., Marouli, M., Kossert, K. & Nähle, O. On the claim of modulations in radon decay and their association with solar rotation. Astropart. Phys. 97, 38–45 (2018).
- 11. Pommé, S. Solar influence on radon decay rates: irradiance or neutrinos?. Eur. Phys. J. C. 79, 73 (2019).
- 12. Pommé, S., Stroh, H. & Van Ammel, R. The <sup>55</sup>Fe half-life measured with a pressurised proportional counter. *Appl. Radiat. Isot.* **148**, 27–34 (2019).
- 13. Pommé, S. & De Hauwere, T. On the significance of modulations in time series. Nucl. Instrum. Methods A 956, 163377 (2020).
- 14. Pommé, S. & Pelczar, K. On the interpretation of annual oscillations in <sup>32</sup>Si and <sup>36</sup>Cl decay rate measurements. *Sci. Rep.* **11**, 16002 (2021).
- 15. Time and Date AS, Valencia Weather History, https://www.timeanddate.com/weather/spain/valencia/historic

 Pommé, S. & Pelczar, K. On the recent claim of correlation between radioactive decay rates and space weather. Eur. Phys. J. C 80, 1093 (2020).

#### Author contributions

S.P.: Concept of work, Interpretation of data, Draft of manuscript. K.P.: Creation of new software, Interpretation of data, Revision of manuscript.

### **Competing interests**

The authors declare no competing interests.

#### Additional information

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to S.P.

Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints.

**Publisher's note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

**Open Access** This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

© The Author(s) 2022