# SCIENTIFIC REPORTS

Received: 7 February 2019 Accepted: 21 June 2019 Published online: 09 July 2019

## **OPEN** Bio-enzymes for inhibition and elimination of Escherichia coli O157:H7 biofilm and their synergistic effect with sodium hypochlorite

Eun Seob Lim<sup>1,4</sup>, Ok Kyung Koo<sup>2,3</sup>, Min-Jeong Kim<sup>4</sup> & Joo-Sung Kim<sup>1,4</sup>

Escherichia coli O157:H7 is one of the most important pathogens worldwide. In this study, three different kinds of enzymes, DNase I, proteinase K and cellulase were evaluated for inhibitory or degrading activity against E. coli O157:H7 biofilm by targeting extracellular DNA, proteins, and cellulose, respectively. The cell number of biofilms formed under proteinase K resulted in a 2.43 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> reduction with an additional synergistic 3.72 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> reduction after NaClO posttreatment, while no significant reduction occurred with NaClO treatment alone. It suggests that protein degradation could be a good way to control the biofilm effectively. In preformed biofilms, all enzymes showed a significant reduction of 16.4–36.7% in biofilm matrix in 10-fold diluted media (p < 0.05). The sequential treatment with proteinase K, cellulase, and NaClO showed a significantly higher synergistic inactivation of 2.83 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> compared to 1.58 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> in the sequence of cellulase, proteinase K, and NaClO (p < 0.05). It suggests that the sequence of multiple enzymes can make a significant difference in the susceptibility of biofilms to NaClO. This study indicates that the combination of extracellular polymeric substance-degrading enzymes with NaClO could be useful for the efficient control of E. coli O157:H7 biofilms.

Escherichia coli O157:H7 is one of the most important foodborne pathogens worldwide, causing gastroenteritis, hemolytic uremic syndrome (HUS), hemorrhagic colitis and thrombotic thrombocytopenic purpura in susceptible groups such as children and elderly people<sup>1</sup>. It is generally highly associated with cattle, and contaminated fresh produce has been recently implicated in foodborne illness by E. coli O157:H7<sup>2</sup>. In addition, such foodborne outbreaks can also occur after consumption of food cross-contaminated with pathogens residing in food-associated environments, including production, transport, and cooking processes<sup>3-5</sup>.

Bacterial cells adhere to abiotic surfaces and produce film-like structures that protect the cells from environmental stresses, such as disinfection in a food processing environment6-11. This structure, called biofilm, can lead to serious problems during food production, distribution and consumption by cross-contamination<sup>6,12-16</sup>. Previous studies showed that biofilms of E. coli O157:H7 that form on food contact surfaces such as stainless steel were resistant to the drying environment<sup>17</sup> and disinfection<sup>18</sup>.

In biofilms, bacterial cells produce extracellular polymeric substances (EPS) with extracellular DNA, protein and polysaccharides and form a slimy film surrounding the bacterial cells<sup>19,20</sup>. Additionally, EPS is involved in the attachment of cells to surfaces and in the formation of three-dimensional structures of biofilms and serves as a

<sup>1</sup>Department of Food Biotechnology, Korea University of Science and Technology, 217, Gajeong-ro, Yuseong-gu, Daejeon, 34113, Republic of Korea. <sup>2</sup>Department of Food and Nutrition, Gyeongsang National University, 501 Jinju-daero, Jinju, Gyeongsangnam-do, 52828, Republic of Korea. <sup>3</sup>Institute of Agriculture and Life Science, Gyeongsang National University, 501 Jinju-daero, Jinju, Gyeongsangnam-do, 52828, Republic of Korea. <sup>4</sup>Research Group of Consumer Safety, Research Division of Strategic Food Technology, Korea Food Research Institute, 245, Nongsaengmyeong-ro, Iseo-myeon, Wanju-gun, Jeollabuk-do, 55365, Republic of Korea. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to J.-S.K. (email: jskim@kfri.re.kr)



**Figure 1.** Quantification of *E. coli* O157:H7 biofilm matrix on polystyrene 96-well microtiter plates by Crystal Violet assay. Biofilms were formed in the presence of enzymes at 25 °C for 24 h ( $\mathbf{a}\sim\mathbf{c}$ ), or preformed biofilms were treated with enzymes at 37 °C for 1 h ( $\mathbf{d}\sim\mathbf{f}$ ) in undiluted ( $\mathbf{a},\mathbf{d}$ ), 10-fold diluted ( $\mathbf{b},\mathbf{e}$ ) and 50-fold diluted ( $\mathbf{c},\mathbf{f}$ ) BHI. The vertical lines represent the standard deviation of three independent experiments performed in triplicate. The different lowercase letters indicate significant differences at *p* < 0.05 using Tukey's HSD.

protective barrier to commercial disinfectants<sup>21–24</sup>. Therefore, for effective microbial control, a novel strategy for efficient inactivation of bacterial cells in biofilms is required.

Recently, methods using EPS-degrading enzymes have been attempted to disintegrate the EPS of biofilms<sup>25</sup>. Sadekuzzaman *et al.* (2015) proposed the use of deoxyribonuclease I (DNase I), lysostaphin (LS),  $\alpha$ -amylase, lyase and lactonase for biofilm control<sup>16</sup>. Lequette *et al.* (2010) applied serine protease, papain,  $\alpha$ -amylase, cellulase, and  $\beta$ -glucanase to control biofilms of isolates from various industrial origins and confirmed various susceptibility of the isolates to the enzymes<sup>26</sup>. Also, Kim *et al.* (2013) applied proteinase K, trypsin, subtilisin and dispersin B to biofilms formed on a fouled reverse osmosis membrane, and showed different efficiencies of these enzymes<sup>25</sup>.

Cellulose and curli fiber are the main constituents of EPS in *E. coli* biofilms<sup>27–29</sup> and could be potential targets for effective biofilm control by enzymes. However, insufficient studies have been conducted regarding the effectiveness or effective treatment methods of enzymes in removing EPS of *E. coli* O157:H7 biofilm. Despite insufficient studies, Martins *et al.* (2012) showed that treatment with antimicrobial agents after enzyme treatment can effectively inactivate microbial cells in biofilms<sup>30</sup>. Such a method of using enzymes or combined with antimicrobial agents has yet to be studied for efficient inactivation of *E. coli* O157:H7 cells in biofilms.

Therefore, in this study, three enzymes, DNase I, proteinase K, and cellulase, targeting extracellular DNA, proteins, and cellulose, respectively, were evaluated for their ability to inhibit biofilm formation or degrade preformed biofilms of *E. coli* O157:H7 under different nutrient concentrations and the synergistic effect combined with NaClO, a major commercial disinfectant.

#### Results

Effect of enzymes on biofilm formation or biofilm developed on polystyrene microtiter plates. To inhibit the biofilm formation of *E. coli* O157:H7, three enzymes, DNase I, proteinase K and cellulase, were added to the inoculum or to the preformed biofilms on the polystyrene microtiter plates in brain heart infusion broth (BHI) at different concentrations (none, 10-fold, and 50-fold diluted) (Fig. 1). When the inoculum was incubated in the presence of DNase I, no reduction in biofilm formation occurred compared to the absence of DNase I, regardless of the nutrient concentrations. However, proteinase K and cellulase treatment showed significantly reduced biofilm formation by 91.1–99.5% and 65.5–98.5%, respectively, regardless of BHI concentration (p < 0.05) (Fig. 1a–c). When the preformed biofilms were treated, DNase I, proteinase K, and cellulase treatment showed significant reduction occurred for all the tested enzymes in undiluted medium (p > 0.05) (Fig. 1d,e). In addition, proteinase K showed a significant reduction of 60.9% in 50-fold diluted BHI (p < 0.05) (Fig. 1f). Overall, proteinase K was most effective for the inhibition of biofilm formation or the degradation of preformed biofilms, followed by cellulase and DNase I. The lower nutrient concentration resulted in a lower biofilm formation ability and a higher susceptibility to post-treated enzymes in general (Fig. 1).

To investigate the effect of proteinase K on the growth of *E. coli* O157:H7, it was incubated in BHI at 25 °C in the presence of proteinase K and the growth of planktonic cells was studied (Supplementary Fig. S1). There was no significant growth defect of cells in the presence of proteinase K (p > 0.05) (Supplementary Fig. S1).

**Combined treatment using enzymes followed by NaClO for the inhibition of biofilm development or removal of biofilm developed on stainless steel.** *E. coli* O157:H7 was incubated in the presence of stainless steel coupons submerged in BHI containing proteinase K or cellulase, then the biofilm formed on the coupon was exposed to sodium hypochlorite (NaClO), and the inactivation effects were studied with microscopic methods and viable counts. SEM analysis revealed that NaClO treatment alone caused a significant deformation of many cells such as flattening on stainless steel coupons (Fig. 2). However, NaClO treatment alone



**Figure 2.** SEM images of *E. coli* O157:H7 biofilms on stainless steel surfaces: No inoculation (**a**,**d**); *E. coli* O157:H7 biofilm untreated (**b**,**e**) or treated with NaClO (**c**,**f**) at 20 ppm for 10 min. The biofilms were formed on a stainless steel surface in BHI at 25 °C for 24 h following 2 h preincubation for attachment. Magnifications and bar markers are ×10,000 and 1  $\mu$ m long (**a**~**c**) or ×50,000 and 100 nm long (**d**~**f**), respectively.





did not significantly affect the biofilm based on the viable counts (p > 0.05) (Fig. 3) and confocal laser scanning microscopy (CLSM) images (Fig. 4).

Proteinase K treatment showed a significant reduction (p < 0.05) of 2.43 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> and a great synergistic inactivation of 6.15 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> with NaClO post-treatment (Fig. 3). In contrast, no reduction in biofilm cells was observed under cellulase treatment alone (p > 0.05), and the biofilm cells treated with cellulase followed by NaClO were significantly inactivated (p < 0.05), but by only 1.74 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> (Fig. 3). Consistent with the viable counts, proteinase K treatment showed a significant decrease in the density of viable cells, and the density of dead cells was significantly increased in combination with NaClO post-treatment in the CLSM analysis (Fig. 4). To understand if such an inactivation effect was due to any corrosion by NaClO on the stainless steel surface, surface corrosion experiment was conducted (Supplementary Fig. S2). No significant changes were observed on the stainless steel surface before and after NaClO exposure (Supplementary Fig. S2).

When enzymes were added to the preformed biofilm on stainless steel coupons in 10-fold diluted BHI, none of the proteinase K, cellulase, or NaClO treatment alone significantly reduced the number of viable cells (p > 0.05) (Fig. 5). However, the combined treatment using proteinase K followed by NaClO, cellulase followed by NaClO or proteinase K followed by cellulase showed a significant (p < 0.05) but limited inactivation with a maximum







**Figure 5.** Numbers of *E. coli* O157:H7 viable cells in preformed biofilms after proteinase K, cellulase, or sequential treatment of both at 37 °C for 1 h each, or followed by NaClO treatment at 20 ppm for 10 min. The biofilms were formed on stainless steel surface in 10-fold diluted BHI at 25 °C for 24 h. The vertical lines represent the standard deviation of three independent experiments performed in duplicate. The different lowercase letters (**a**-**d**) indicate significant differences at p < 0.05 using Tukey's HSD.



**Figure 6.** Fluorescence microscopy images of curli amyloid fibers with cellulose (a~e) and cellulose (f~j) of *E. coli* O157:H7 preformed biofilm matrix untreated (**a**,**f**) or treated with proteinase K (**b**,**g**), cellulase (**c**,**h**), proteinase K followed by cellulase (**d**,**i**) and cellulase followed by proteinase K (**e**,**j**) at 37 °C for 1 h for each enzyme after biofilm formation in 10-fold diluted BHI at 25 °C for 24 h. Curli amyloid fibers were stained by Congo Red (red) and cellulose was stained by Congo Red (red) and Calcofluor (blue). Arrows indicate the noticeable reduction in biofilm biomass. Bar markers are 100 µm long.

reduction of 1.05 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup>. However, the sequential treatment of both enzymes followed by NaClO showed a notable reduction of viable cells. In particular, there was a considerable synergistic inactivation of 2.83 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> in the order of proteinase K, cellulase, and NaClO (Fig. 5). Interestingly, a different enzyme sequential treatment in the order of cellulase, proteinase K, followed by NaClO was significantly less effective with only 1.58 log CFU/cm<sup>2</sup> (p < 0.05). However, no significant difference was found between the two different treatments without NaClO (p > 0.05) (Fig. 5). Moreover, in the fluorescence microscopic analysis, such a sequential multiple enzyme treatment clearly showed a great reduction in the biofilm matrix compared to the single enzymes showing a limited reduction (Fig. 6).

Lastly, we confirmed the presence of genetic factors involved in biofilm formation (*csgD* and *flhDC*) and stress responses (*rpoS*, *oxyR*, *soxR*, *nemR*, and *rclR*) by PCR amplification of this strain (Supplementary Fig. S3).

#### Discussion

Recently, methods using EPS-degrading enzymes have been studied for potential applications in biofilm control<sup>25</sup>. In this study, we tested the applicability or efficacy of those enzymes, DNase I, proteinase K, and cellulase for the prevention of biofilm formation or disruption of pre-existing biofilms of *E. coli* O157:H7.

DNase I was generally not effective in controlling *E. coli* O157:H7 biofilms in this study. Extracellular DNA is known to play an important structural role as a component of various bacterial biofilms and to protect bacterial cells from environmental stresses<sup>20,31–37</sup>. Some studies revealed that extracellular DNA produced by *E. coli* binds to the DNABII protein and increases the stability of biofilm<sup>38,39</sup>. Tetz and Tetz (2010) reported that in the presence of DNase I, the biofilm formation and antibiotic resistance of *E. coli* were reduced<sup>40</sup>. Furthermore, Nijland *et al.* (2010) have shown that the DNase (NucB) synthesized by *Bacillus licheniformis* dispersed biofilms of *E. coli*<sup>41</sup>. The lack of DNase-induced biofilm reduction in this study may represent the difference in EPS structures depending on the strains, causing a difference in susceptibility to DNase.

Previous studies have already demonstrated that the biofilms of many pathogens, such as *E. coli* O157:H7<sup>42</sup>, *Salmonella*<sup>43</sup>, *Listeria monocytogenes*<sup>44</sup> and *Staphylococcus aureus*<sup>45,46</sup>, can be degraded by proteinase K. An extracellular protein fiber that constitutes the biofilm matrix of *E. coli* called curli is known to be one of the major components of *E. coli* biofilms and helps attach cells to abiotic surfaces and form biofilms<sup>29,47–50</sup>. Vacheva *et al.* (2012) have shown that protein/peptide factors involved in forming a biofilm are reduced by proteinase K<sup>51</sup>. CsgA, a major component of curli is also degradable by proteinase K although its fiber form is only partly degradable<sup>52</sup>. Therefore, in this study, proteinase K may have affected the function or assembly of curli and interfered with the initial attachment of inoculated cells, greatly preventing the biofilm formation of *E. coli* O157:H7 in our study (Fig. 3). The growth rate of *E. coli* O157:H7 in the presence of proteinase K was not significantly different (Supplementary Fig. S1), indicating that proteinase K did not affect the viability or growth rate of *E. coli* O157:H7 ATCC43894 and that the reduced biofilm formation with proteinase K treatment was not due to any growth defects. Our results strongly suggest that the proteinase K-mediated degradation of proteins such as curli can be an effective way to prevent biofilm formation or reduce the preformed biofilms of *E. coli* O157:H7.

Cellulose is known to play a role in surface attachment and biofilm construction<sup>53</sup> and to protect biofilms against disinfectants in some bacteria<sup>54,55</sup>. Some studies showed that the biofilms of *Salmonella*<sup>43</sup>, *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*<sup>56</sup>, *P. flavescens*<sup>57</sup>, *P. fluorescens*<sup>26</sup> and *Burkholderia cepacia*<sup>58</sup> can be controlled by cellulase. Cellulose is also an important architectural element in *E. coli* biofilms<sup>29,59-61</sup>, which can be inhibited or degraded by cellulase<sup>56-58</sup>. Among different stages of biofilm formation, bacterial cellulose fibers are involved in irreversible attachment, which is a step that leads to the early development stage of biofilm formation and affects the maturation of biofilm<sup>62,63</sup>. Therefore, in our study, the cellulase present in the inoculum seems to have affected the formation of biofilm by interfering with the irreversible attachment stage. Additionally, the result of cellulase post-treatment

strongly suggests that cellulose is the major architectural element of the mature biofilm of *E. coli* O157:H7 used in this study. However, proteinase K, a protease, seems to be more effective in the control of *E. coli* O157:H7 biofilm than cellulase belonging to polysaccharidase based on our study. This tendency is similar to the previous study of Lequette *et al.*<sup>26</sup>. Taken together, it seems that proteases are more efficient and cover a wider range of strains than polysaccharidases.

Some studies have shown that the biofilm forming ability of *E. coil* was reduced in minimal medium, similar to the results in our study<sup>64</sup>. Additionally, there have been reports that the addition of protein components in the growth medium increased polysaccharides in biofilms of *Proteus mirabilis*<sup>65</sup>, and excess nitrogen and carbon sources were used to synthesize additional extracellular proteins and polysaccharides in *Bacillus* spp.<sup>66</sup>. Therefore, we hypothesize that the lack of available nutrients may have resulted in the poor biosynthesis of biofilm-related factors such as extracellular proteins and polysaccharides. In addition, our study suggests that nutrient availability may affect the biofilm structure or integrity of *E. coli* O157:H7 based on the increased vulnerability of biofilms to enzyme post-treatment under nutrient-deficient conditions (Fig. 1).

NaClO, known as a disinfectant commonly used in a variety of food-associated environments<sup>8,67</sup>, has a broad disinfection range for various bacteria by inactivating enzymes necessary for the life cycle and by damaging cell membranes and DNA<sup>68</sup>. Our study demonstrates that NaClO treatment alone is limited in removing E. coli O157:H7 biofilm. Similarly, several studies have also shown that biofilm-forming microorganisms are resistant to disinfectants<sup>10,11,69-74</sup>. Corcoran et al. (2014) reported that the biofilm formed by Salmonella cannot be removed by NaClO75. Ryu et al. (2005) described that the EPS components of E. coli O157:H7 biofilm might serve as a protective barrier to NaClO<sup>24</sup>. Additionally, the efficacy of disinfection by NaClO was reduced by organic matter such as protein or cellulose<sup>54,55,76</sup>. From these studies, it is considered that the high resistance of biofilm cells against NaClO in this study may be due to the barrier effect of the EPS matrix and the reduction of disinfection efficacy by organic matter in the EPS matrix. Therefore, the degradation of EPS would be a good strategy to improve the efficacy of NaClO. From our results, it was confirmed that the biofilm of E. coli O157:H7 formed in the presence of proteinase K was greatly inactivated by subsequent NaClO treatment compared to the biofilm in the absence of proteinase K (Figs 3 and 4). This outcome suggests that proteinase K treatment combined with disinfectants such as NaClO can synergistically improve biofilm prevention or disinfection. Similarly, Cui et al. (2016) showed that E. coli O157:H7 biofilm was greatly reduced by thyme oil in the presence of proteinase K<sup>42</sup>. Because proteinase K degrades the various protein/peptide factors associated with biofilm formation<sup>51</sup> and curli is one of the protein factors associated with early attachment and has protective properties in E. coli biofilm<sup>48,50,77</sup>, it is likely that proteins including curli are degraded by proteinase K. Ryu and Beuchat (2005) reported that E. coli O157:H7 became more resistant to chlorine in an environment that produces curli well<sup>24</sup>. Bap-mediated Staphylococcus aureus biofilm was dispersed by proteinase K<sup>45</sup>. Therefore, proteinase K may cause defects in the biofilm structure and reduce the barrier properties, thereby facilitating NaClO penetration and reducing the survivability of cells. Therefore, our data suggest that proteins may be good targets to remove to allow the efficient penetration of disinfectants such as NaClO to inactivate E. coli O157:H7 cells in biofilm. In addition, the increased sensitivity of biofilm cells to NaClO after exposure to proteinase K compared to cellulase strongly suggests that a proper choice of enzymes is important for efficient inactivation of biofilm cells using disinfectants (Fig. 3).

The biofilm CLSM images show a weak intensity at the middle of the biofilm (Fig. 4). Considering the dyes used in this study, the amount of DNA in cells or extracellular DNA could be much reduced in the weak intensity regions. A distinct phenotype depending on the region of the biofilm was also previously observed in non-pathogenic *E. coli*<sup>60</sup>.

Our study suggests that the sequential treatment using multiple enzymes can be more effective than single enzymes in removing a preformed biofilm (Fig. 5). Such an improved efficacy is also evident in the fluorescence microscopic analysis (Fig. 6). Furthermore, the differential inactivation efficacy depending on the treatment order of multiple enzymes prior to NaClO treatment strongly suggests that it is important for efficient inactivation of *E. coli* O157:H7 biofilm cells (Fig. 5). It may also reflect the structural or spatial distribution of biofilm constituents. Our data may suggest that proteins exist more commonly than cellulose in the outermost layer of biofilm matrix protecting cells. From the above results, it can be concluded that the appropriate combination and treatment order can increase the versatility and efficiency of enzymes in biofilm control.

In fact, the method of microbial control using enzymes is disadvantageous in terms of cost and stability for commercial use. In addition, enzyme activity is highly dependent on environmental factors such as temperature and is optimal only in limited conditions. When using protease, self-degradation causing instability should also be considered<sup>78</sup>. As a solution, enzyme activity can be stabilized by immobilizing enzymes on abiotic surfaces<sup>78</sup>. In addition, it will be cost-effective if sufficient stability is maintained after repetitive use through immobilization.

In conclusion, the biofilm formation of *E. coli* O157:H7 can be significantly inhibited in the presence of enzymes such as proteinase K or cellulase. In particular, biofilm inhibition can be synergistically enhanced by proteinase K combined with NaClO treatment. Additionally, sequential treatment using multiple enzymes followed by disinfectant can synergistically inactivate the cells in preformed biofilms. Accordingly, the combination of EPS-degrading enzymes with conventional disinfectants could be used as an alternative strategy for efficient control of biofilms produced by foodborne pathogens such as *E. coli* O157:H7 in the food-associated environment.

#### Methods

**Bacterial strain and growth conditions.** *E. coli* O157:H7 ATCC43894 (American Type Culture Collection, Manassas, VA, USA) was used in this study. The bacterial strain was inoculated in brain heart infusion broth (BHI, Merck, NJ, USA) and incubated at 37 °C for 18–24 h in a shaking incubator. The inoculum was prepared by diluting the overnight culture in BHI to approximately  $10^7$  CFU/ml at an OD<sub>600</sub> of 0.02–0.03, and the number of cells was confirmed by plating on tryptic soy agar (TSA, Merck) and incubating for 24 h at 37 °C.

**Evaluation of enzymatic effects on biofilm on polystyrene surface.** Biofilm formation was performed on a polystyrene surface in a 96-well cell culture plate (SPL, Pocheon, Korea) and the biofilm matrix was quantified by crystal violet (CV) assay as previously described<sup>5</sup>. To examine the ability of enzymes to inhibit biofilm formation, 200 µl of inoculum with enzymes was incubated on a 96-well plate (SPL) at 25 °C for 24 h. For degradation activity against preformed biofilm, 200 µl of inoculum, as prepared above, was incubated on a 96-well plate at 25 °C for 24 h. Then, the wells were washed once by dispensing and aspirating 400 µl of phosphate buffered saline (PBS, Dongin, Seoul, Korea), post-treated with the enzymes diluted in BHI (200 µl), and incubated at 37 °C for 1 h. Final concentrations of enzymes were as follows: 0.1% (v/v) DNase I (Thermo Scientific<sup>™</sup>, Waltham, MA, USA), 1% (v/v) proteinase K (QIAGEN, Hilden, Germany), and 20 mg/ml cellulase (Duchefa Biochemie, Haarlem, The Netherlands). After incubation, the medium containing the enzymes was removed by pipetting and the wells were washed once with PBS. Then, 200 µl of CV solution (bioWORLD, Ohio, USA) diluted to 1% in deionized water (DW) was added and incubated for 30 min at room temperature (RT). After washing three times with PBS, 200 µl of absolute ethanol (EtOH, JT Baker, MA, USA) was added and incubated for 15 min at RT for destaining. After 100 µl of the destaining solution was transferred to a new 96-well plate, the absorbance was measured at 595 nm using an Infinite® M200 PRO NanoQuant microplate reader (Tecan, Männedorf, Switzerland). The final OD values at 595 nm were calculated by subtracting the OD value of the negative control well (incubating BHI only) from the OD values of the samples. When the measurement values exceeded an OD<sub>595</sub> of 2.0, the samples were appropriately diluted in EtOH to an  $OD_{595}$  between 0.5–2.0, and the dilution factors were multiplied. All experiments were performed independently three times in triplicate.

**Combined treatment for removal of biofilms on stainless steel.** Food grade stainless steel coupons (#304,  $2 \text{ cm} \times 2 \text{ cm} \times 0.2 \text{ cm}$ ) were used as the surface for biofilm formation. Coupons were washed with 2% RBS<sup>™</sup> 35 Concentrate (Thermo Scientific<sup>™</sup>) with sonication and rinsed with DW followed by EtOH. Washed coupons were dried in a dry oven and autoclaved at 121°C for 15 min. To examine the synergistic effect of enzymes with sodium hypochlorite (NaClO; Junsei, Tokyo, Japan) on biofilm formation, 4.5 ml of the inoculum was inoculated in each well of a sterile 6-well plate (SPL) with a sterile stainless steel coupon and incubated at 25 °C for 2h for cell adhesion. After the coupons were washed once with sterile PBS, 4.5 ml of the mixtures of fresh BHI with 1% proteinase K or with 20 mg/ml cellulase were added to each well with the coupon and incubated at 25 °C for 24 h. Fresh BHI without inoculum was used as a negative sample. For sequential treatment of preformed biofilms with enzymes followed by NaClO, stainless steel coupons were inoculated and incubated at 25 °C for 2 h, washed once with PBS, and 4.5 ml of fresh BHI was added and incubated at 25 °C for 24 h. After washing three times with PBS, 4.5 ml of the mixtures of fresh BHI with 1% proteinase K or with 20 mg/ml cellulase were added individually or sequentially and incubated at 37 °C for 1 h for each treatment. For NaClO treatment, the coupons were washed with PBS and treated with 4.5 ml of NaClO at 20 ppm in DW at RT for 10 min. PBS was used as a negative control. Then, the coupons were briefly rinsed once with PBS and vortexed in 15 ml of PBS with sterile glass beads for 60 s at maximum speed. Each sample was serially diluted, plated onto sorbitol MacConkey Agar (Oxoid, Wesel, Germany), and incubated at 37 °C up to 24 h for enumeration of viable cells attached to coupons. All experiments were performed independently three times in duplicate.

**Growth phenotype.** Proteinase K was added at 1% to the inoculum described above and the samples were incubated at 25 °C and taken at 2 h intervals. The number of cells was confirmed by plating on TSA and incubating the plates for 24 h at 37 °C. All experiments were performed independently two times in triplicate.

**Surface corrosion experiment.** Stainless steel coupons described above were treated with NaClO at 20 ppm at RT for 10 min, washed once with PBS, and dried in desiccator at RT. Stainless steel surfaces before and after treatment with NaClO were imaged by Dino-Lite AM4113T (AnMo Electronics, Hsinchu, Taiwan).

**Scanning electron microscopy (SEM) imaging.** SEM was performed as previously described<sup>79</sup>. The samples were fixed with Karnovsky's glutaraldehyde (0.05 M sodium cacodylate buffer (EMS, Hatfield, PA, USA), 2% paraformaldehyde (EMS), and 2% glutaraldehyde (EMS)) at 4 °C for 2 h. After washing with 0.05 M sodium cacodylate buffer twice, the samples were incubated in 1% osmium tetroxide (EMS) with 0.05 M cacodylate buffer at 4 °C for 2 h. Then, the samples were washed in DW and dehydrated in increasing alcohol concentrations (30%, 50%, 70%, 80%, 90% and 100%). The samples were dried with hexamethyldisilazane (EMS) for 18–24 h in a biosafety cabinet. After coating with Pt, the samples were examined by a scanning electron microscope (Carl Zeiss, Jena, Germany).

**Confocal laser scanning microscopy (CLSM) imaging.** The samples were stained with a LIVE/ DEAD<sup>TM</sup> BacLight<sup>TM</sup> Bacterial Viability kit (Invitrogen<sup>TM</sup>, CA, USA) according to the manufacturer's instructions. Microscopic imaging was performed at 10 × magnification on a Leica TCS SP8 X confocal laser scanning microscope (CLSM, Leica, Heidelberg, Germany) using green (ex 490 nm, em 550 nm) and red (ex 570 nm, em 650 nm) wavelengths with 1 µm intervals to the z-axis. Images were merged and reconstructed to 3D and Z-stack images using the Leica Application Suite X software (Leica).

**Fluorescence microscopy imaging.** The samples were stained with Congo Red (Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis, MO, USA) for curli amyloid fibers plus cellulose and Calcofluor (Sigma-Aldrich) for cellulose using a modified protocol<sup>80,81</sup>. Briefly, the samples were stained in fresh alkalinized alcoholic Congo Red with Calcofluor dye (2% (w/v) NaCl (Duchefa Biochemie), 80% (v/v) EtOH (JT Baker), 0.01% (w/v) NaOH (Daejung, Siheung, Korea), 0.2% (w/v) Congo Red (Sigma-Aldrich), 250 µg/ml Calcofluor (Sigma-Aldrich)), incubated at RT for 30 min in the dark and dehydrated twice in absolute alcohol (JT Baker) at RT for 1 min each. Microscopic imaging was

performed on an Eclipse 80i upright fluorescence microscope (Nikon, Tokyo, Japan) using blue (ex 360 nm, em 460 nm) and red (ex 560 nm, em 630 nm) wavelengths.

**PCR analysis.** The inoculum described above was centrifuged at  $13,000 \times g$  for 5 min and the pellet was used for genomic DNA extraction using PrepMan<sup>TM</sup> Ultra Sample Preparation Reagent (Thermo Scientific, Waltham, USA) and PCR inhibitor removed by OneStep<sup>TM</sup> PCR inhibitor Removal Kit (Zymo Research, Irvine, USA). Target genes and PCR primer sequences are listed in Supplementary Table S1. The PCR reaction was composed of extracted DNA, primer pairs for each target gene, PCR-grade water, and Takara Ex Taq version 2.0 (Takara, Kusatsu, Japan). The PCR cycle was as follows: initial denaturation at 95 °C for 10 min, then 30 cycles of 1) Denaturation at 95 °C for 15 s, 2) Annealing and extension at 60 °C for 30 s. PCR products were separated by electrophoresis on 0.8% agarose gel in TAE buffer (40 mM Tris-HCl, 40 mM acetate, 1.0 mM EDTA), stained with Staining STAR (DyneBio, Seongnam, Korea) and confirmed with Gel Doc<sup>TM</sup> EZ Imager (Bio-Rad, Richmond, USA).

**Statistical analyses.** Statistical significance was determined by Tukey's Honest Significant Difference (HSD) test and Student's t-test procedure of Minitab 17 (Minitab Inc., PA, USA). The level of statistical significance was p < 0.05.

#### Data Availability

All data generated or analysed during this study are included in this published article and its Supplementary information files.

#### References

- 1. Doyle, M. P. Escherichia coli O157: H7 and its significance in foods. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 12, 289-301 (1991).
- Wadamori, Y., Gooneratne, R. & Hussain, M. A. Outbreaks and factors influencing microbiological contamination of fresh produce. J. Sci. Food Agric. 97, 1396–1403 (2017).
- 3. Beuchat, L. R. Ecological factors influencing survival and growth of human pathogens on raw fruits and vegetables. *Microbes Infect.* 4, 413–423 (2002).
- 4. Mead, P. S. et al. Food-related illness and death in the United States. Emerg. Infect. Dis. 5, 607-625 (1999).
- Lim, E. S., Lee, J. E., Kim, J.-S. & Koo, O. K. Isolation of indigenous bacteria from a cafeteria kitchen and their biofilm formation and disinfectant susceptibility. *LWT - Food Sci. Technol.* 77, 376–382 (2017).
- 6. Kumar, C. G. & Anand, S. K. Significance of microbial biofilms in food industry: a review. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 42, 9–27 (1998).
- Norwood, D. E. & Gilmour, A. The growth and resistance to sodium hypochlorite of Listeria monocytogenes in a steady-state multispecies biofilm. J. Appl. Microbiol. 88, 512–520 (2000).
- Stewart, P. S., Rayner, J., Roe, F. & Rees, W. M. Biofilm penetration and disinfection efficacy of alkaline hypochlorite and chlorosulfamates. J. Appl. Microbiol. 91, 525–532 (2001).
- Williams, M. M. & Braun-Howland, E. B. Growth of Escherichia coli in model distribution system biofilms exposed to hypochlorous acid or monochloramine. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 69, 5463–5471 (2003).
- Bower, C. K., McGuire, J. & Daeschel, M. A. The adhesion and detachment of bacteria and spores on food-contact surfaces. *Trends Food Sci. Technol.* 7, 152–157 (1996).
- Sidhu, M. S., Langsrud, S. & Holck, A. Disinfectant and antibiotic resistance of lactic acid bacteria isolated from the food industry. Microb. Drug Resist. 7, 73–83 (2001).
- 12. Brooks, J. D. & Flint, S. H. Biofilms in the food industry: problems and potential solutions. *Int. J. Food Sci. Technol.* 43, 2163–2176 (2008).
- 13. Epstein, A. K., Pokroy, B., Seminara, A. & Aizenberg, J. Bacterial biofilm shows persistent resistance to liquid wetting and gas penetration. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 108, 995–1000 (2011).
- Kusumaningrum, H. D., Riboldi, G., Hazeleger, W. C. & Beumer, R. R. Survival of foodborne pathogens on stainless steel surfaces and cross-contamination to foods. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 85, 227–236 (2003).
- Moore, C. M., Sheldon, B. W. & Jaykus, L.-A. Transfer of Salmonella and Campylobacter from stainless steel to romaine lettuce. J. Food Prot. 66, 2231–2236 (2003).
- Sadekuzzaman, M., Yang, S., Mizan, M. F. R. & Ha, S. D. Current and recent advanced strategies for combating biofilms. Compr. Rev. Food Sci. Food Saf. 14, 491–509 (2015).
- Adator, E. H., Cheng, M., Holley, R., McAllister, T. & Narvaez-Bravo, C. Ability of Shiga toxigenic Escherichia coli to survive within dry-surface biofilms and transfer to fresh lettuce. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 269, 52–59 (2018).
- Fouladkhah, A., Geornaras, I. & Sofos, J. N. Biofilm formation of O157 and non-O157 shiga toxin-producing Escherichia coli and multidrug-resistant and susceptible Salmonella Typhimurium and Newport and their inactivation by sanitizers. J. Food Sci. 78, M880–M886 (2013).
- 19. Simões, M., Simões, L. C. & Vieira, M. J. A review of current and emergent biofilm control strategies. *LWT Food Sci. Technol.* 43, 573–583 (2010).
- 20. Flemming, H.-C. & Wingender, J. The biofilm matrix. Nat. Rev. Microbiol. 8, 623-633 (2010).
- 21. Weiner, R., Langille, S. & Quintero, E. Structure, function and immunochemistry of bacterial exopolysaccharides. *J. Ind. Microbiol.* **15**, 339–346 (1995).
- Danese, P. N., Pratt, L. A. & Kolter, R. Exopolysaccharide production is required for development of Escherichia coli K-12 biofilm architecture. J. Bacteriol. 182, 3593–3596 (2000).
- Antoniou, K. & Frank, J. F. Removal of Pseudomonas putida biofilm and associated extracellular polymeric substances from stainless steel by alkali cleaning. J. Food Prot. 68, 277–281 (2005).
- Ryu, J.-H. & Beuchat, L. R. Biofilm formation by Escherichia coli O157:H7 on stainless steel: effect of exopolysaccharide and curli production on its resistance to chlorine. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 71, 247–254 (2005).
- Kim, L. H. et al. Effects of enzymatic treatment on the reduction of extracellular polymeric substances (EPS) from biofouled membranes. Desalin. Water Treat. 51, 6355–6361 (2013).
- Lequette, Y., Boels, G., Clarisse, M. & Faille, C. Using enzymes to remove biofilms of bacterial isolates sampled in the food-industry. *Biofouling* 26, 421–431 (2010).
- 27. Olsén, A., Jonsson, A. & Normark, S. Fibronectin binding mediated by a novel class of surface organelles on Escherichia coli. *Nature* **340**, 301–303 (1989).
- Zogaj, X., Nimtz, M., Rohde, M., Bokranz, W. & Romling, U. The multicellular morphotypes of Salmonella Typhimurium and Escherichia coli produce cellulose as the second component of the extracellular matrix. *Mol. Microbiol.* 39, 1452–1463 (2001).
- 29. Hobley, L., Harkins, C., MacPhee, C. E. & Stanley-Wall, N. R. Giving structure to the biofilm matrix: an overview of individual strategies and emerging common themes. *FEMS Microbiol. Rev.* **39**, 649–669 (2015).

- Martins, M., Henriques, M., Lopez-Ribot, J. L. & Oliveira, R. Addition of DNase improves the *in vitro* activity of antifungal drugs against Candida albicans biofilms. *Mycoses* 55, 80–85 (2012).
- Das, T., Sehar, S. & Manefield, M. The roles of extracellular DNA in the structural integrity of extracellular polymeric substance and bacterial biofilm development. *Environ. Microbiol. Rep.* 5, 778–786 (2013).
- 32. Steinberger, R. & Holden, P. Extracellular DNA in single-and multiple-species unsaturated biofilms. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 71, 5404–5410 (2005).
- 33. Qin, Z. *et al.* Role of autolysin-mediated DNA release in biofilm formation of Staphylococcus epidermidis. *Microbiology* **153**, 2083–2092 (2007).
- Izano, E. A., Amarante, M. A., Kher, W. B. & Kaplan, J. B. Differential roles of poly-N-acetylglucosamine surface polysaccharide and extracellular DNA in Staphylococcus aureus and Staphylococcus epidermidis biofilms. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 74, 470–476 (2008).
- Guiton, P. S. et al. Contribution of autolysin and sortase A during Enterococcus faecalis DNA-dependent biofilm development. Infect. Immun. 77, 3626–3638 (2009).
- Nur, A. et al. Effects of extracellular DNA and DNA-binding protein on the development of a Streptococcus intermedius biofilm. J. Appl. Microbiol. 115, 260–270 (2013).
- Okshevsky, M. & Meyer, R. L. The role of extracellular DNA in the establishment, maintenance and perpetuation of bacterial biofilms. Crit. Rev. Microbiol. 41, 341–352 (2015).
- Devaraj, A., Justice, S. S., Bakaletz, L. O. & Goodman, S. D. DNABII proteins play a central role in UPEC biofilm structure. *Mol. Microbiol.* 96, 1119–1135 (2015).
- Goodman, S. D. et al. Biofilms can be dispersed by focusing the immune system on a common family of bacterial nucleoidassociated proteins. *Mucosal Immunol.* 4, 625–637 (2011).
- 40. Tetz, V. V. & Tetz, G. V. Effect of extracellular DNA destruction by DNase I on characteristics of forming biofilms. DNA Cell Biol. 29, 399–405 (2010).
- 41. Nijland, R., Hall, M. J. & Burgess, J. G. Dispersal of biofilms by secreted, matrix degrading, bacterial DNase. *PLoS One* 5, e15668 (2010).
- 42. Cui, H., Ma, C. & Lin, L. Co-loaded proteinase K/thyme oil liposomes for inactivation of Escherichia coli O157:H7 biofilms on cucumber. *Food Funct.* 7, 4030–4040 (2016).
- Wang, H., Wang, H., Xing, T., Wu, N. & Xu, X. Removal of Salmonella biofilm formed under meat processing environment by surfactant in combination with bio-enzyme. *LWT - Food Sci. Technol.* 66, 298–304 (2016).
- Nguyen, U. T. & Burrows, L. L. DNase I and proteinase K impair Listeria monocytogenes biofilm formation and induce dispersal of pre-existing biofilms. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 187, 26–32 (2014).
- Shukla, S. K. & Rao, T. S. Dispersal of Bap-mediated Staphylococcus aureus biofilm by proteinase K. J. Antibiot. (Tokyo). 66, 55–60 (2013).
- Shukla, S. K. & Rao, T. S. Staphylococcus aureus biofilm removal by targeting biofilm-associated extracellular proteins. *Indian J. Med. Res.* 146, S1–S8 (2017).
- Pawar, D. M., Rossman, M. L. & Chen, J. Role of curli fimbriae in mediating the cells of enterohaemorrhagic Escherichia coli to attach to abiotic surfaces. J. Appl. Microbiol. 99, 418–425 (2005).
- Biesecker, S. G., Nicastro, L. K., Wilson, R. P. & Tükel, Ç. The functional amyloid curli protects Escherichia coli against complementmediated bactericidal activity. *Biomolecules* 8, 5 (2018).
- 49. Pesavento, C. *et al.* Inverse regulatory coordination of motility and curli-mediated adhesion in Escherichia coli. *Genes Dev.* 22, 2434–2446 (2008).
- Cookson, A. L., Cooley, W. A. & Woodward, M. J. The role of type 1 and curli fimbriae of Shiga toxin-producing Escherichia coli in adherence to abiotic surfaces. Int. J. Med. Microbiol. 292, 195–205 (2002).
- Vacheva, A., Ivanova, R., Paunova-Krasteva, T. & Stoitsova, S. Released products of pathogenic bacteria stimulate biofilm formation by Escherichia coli K-12 strains. *Antonie Van Leeuwenhoek* 102, 105–119 (2012).
- 52. Shewmaker, F. *et al.* The functional curli amyloid is not based on in-register parallel β-sheet structure. *J. Biol. Chem.* **284**, 25065–25076 (2009).
- Barak, J. D., Jahn, C. E., Gibson, D. L. & Charkowski, A. O. The role of cellulose and O-antigen capsule in the colonization of plants by Salmonella enterica. *Mol. Plant. Microbe. Interact.* 20, 1083–1091 (2007).
- Gerstel, U. & Romling, U. Oxygen tension and nutrient starvation are major signals that regulate agfD promoter activity and expression of the multicellular morphotype in Salmonella Typhimurium. *Environ. Microbiol.* 3, 638–648 (2001).
- Solano, C. et al. Genetic analysis of Salmonella Enteritidis biofilm formation: Critical role of cellulose. Mol. Microbiol. 43, 793–808 (2002).
- Loiselle, M. & Anderson, K. W. The use of cellulase in inhibiting biofilm formation from organisms commonly found on medical implants. *Biofouling* 19, 77–85 (2003).
- Cescutti, P. et al. Structural investigation of the exopolysaccharide produced by Pseudomonas flavescens strain B62–degradation by a fungal cellulase and isolation of the oligosaccharide repeating unit. Eur. J. Biochem. 251, 971–979 (1998).
- Rajasekharan, S. K. & Ramesh, S. Cellulase inhibits Burkholderia cepacia biofilms on diverse prosthetic materials. Polish. J. Microbiol. 62, 327-330 (2013).
- Gualdi, L. et al. Cellulose modulates biofilm formation by counteracting curli-mediated colonization of solid surfaces in Escherichia coli. Microbiology 154, 2017–2024 (2008).
- Serra, D. O., Richter, A. M. & Hengge, R. Cellulose as an architectural element in spatially structured Escherichia coli biofilms. J. Bacteriol. 195, 5540–5554 (2013).
- Ryu, J.-H. & Beuchat, L. R. Factors affecting production of extracellular carbohydrate complexes by Escherichia coli O157:H7. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 95, 189–204 (2004).
- Stoodley, P., Sauer, K., Davies, D. G. & Costerton, J. W. Biofilms as complex differentiated communities. Annu. Rev. Microbiol. 56, 187–209 (2002).
- 63. Laus, M. C., van Brussel, A. A. N. & Kijne, J. W. Role of cellulose fibrils and exopolysaccharides of Rhizobium leguminosarum in attachment to and infection of Vicia sativa root hairs. *Mol. Plant. Microbe. Interact.* 18, 533–538 (2005).
- 64. Bleotu, C. *et al.* The influence of nutrient culture media on Escherichia coli adhesion and biofilm formation ability. *Rom. Biotechnol. Lett.* **22**, 12483–12491 (2017).
- 65. Moryl, M., Kaleta, A., Strzelecki, K., Różalska, S. & Różalski, A. Effect of nutrient and stress factors on polysaccharides synthesis in Proteus mirabilis biofilm. Acta Biochim. Pol. 61, 133–139 (2014).
- Czaczyk, K., Białas, W. & Myszka, K. Cell surface hydrophobicity of Bacillus spp. as a function of nutrient supply and lipopeptides biosynthesis and its role in adhesion. Polish. J. Microbiol. 57, 313–319 (2008).
- 67. Beuchat, L. R. & Ryu, J. H. Produce handling and processing practices. Emerg. Infect. Dis. 3, 459-465 (1997).
- Fukuzaki, S. Mechanisms of actions of sodium hypochlorite in cleaning and disinfection processes. *Biocontrol Sci.* 11, 147–157 (2006).
- 69. Frank, J. F. & Koffi, R. A. Surface-adherent growth of Listeria monocytogenes is associated with increased resistance to surfactant sanitizers and heat. J. Food Prot. 53, 550–554 (1990).
- Gilbert, P., Allison, D. G. & McBain, A. J. Biofilms in vitro and in vivo: do singular mechanisms imply cross-resistance? J. Appl. Microbiol. 92, 985–1105 (2002).

- Robbins, J. B., Fisher, C. W., Moltz, A. G. & Martin, S. E. Elimination of Listeria monocytogenes biofilms by ozone, chlorine, and hydrogen peroxide. J. Food Prot. 68, 494–498 (2005).
- Pan, Y., Breidt, F. & Kathariou, S. Resistance of Listeria monocytogenes biofilms to sanitizing agents in a simulated food processing environment. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 72, 7711–7717 (2006).
- Berrang, M. E., Frank, J. F. & Meinersmann, R. J. Effect of chemical sanitizers with and without ultrasonication on Listeria monocytogenes as a biofilm within polyvinyl chloride drain pipes. J. Food Prot. 71, 66–69 (2008).
- 74. Prakash, B., Veeregowda, B. M. & Krishnappa, G. Biofilms: A survival strategy of bacteria. Curr. Sci. 85, 1299-1307 (2003).
- Corcoran, M. et al. Commonly used disinfectants fail to eradicate Salmonella enterica biofilms from food contact surface materials. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 80, 1507–1514 (2014).
- Bloomfield, S. F., Arthur, M., Looney, E., Begun, K. & Patel, H. Comparative testing of disinfectant and antiseptic products using proposed European suspension testing methods. *Lett. Appl. Microbiol.* 13, 233–237 (1991).
- 77. Patel, J., Sharma, M. & Ravishakar, S. Effect of curli expression and hydrophobicity of Escherichia coli O157:H7 on attachment to fresh produce surfaces. J. Appl. Microbiol. 110, 737–745 (2011).
- 78. Cordeiro, A. L. & Werner, C. Enzymes for antifouling strategies. J. Adhes. Sci. Technol. 25, 2317-2344 (2011).
- Lim, E. S. & Kim, J.-S. Role of eptC in biofilm formation by Campylobacter jejuni NCTC11168 on polystyrene and glass surfaces. J. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 27, 1609–1616 (2017).
- 80. Elghetany, M. T., Saleem, A. & Barr, K. The congo red stain revisited. Ann. Clin. Lab. Sci. 19, 190-195 (1989).
- Yang, Y. et al. Biofilm formation of Salmonella Enteritidis under food-related environmental stress conditions and its subsequent resistance to chlorine treatment. Food Microbiol. 54, 98–105 (2016).

#### Acknowledgements

This research was supported by Main Research Program (E0192101-01, E0142104-05) of the Korea Food Research Institute (KFRI) funded by the Ministry of Science and ICT.

#### **Author Contributions**

J.K. and E.L. conceived the experiments. E.L. conducted the experiments and wrote the manuscript. J.K., E.L., O.K. and M.K. analyzed the results. All authors reviewed the manuscript.

### Additional Information

Supplementary information accompanies this paper at https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-019-46363-w.

**Competing Interests:** The authors declare no competing interests.

**Publisher's note:** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

**Open Access** This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

© The Author(s) 2019