Rhythmic arm movement is not discrete

Stefan Schaal, Dagmar Sternad, Rieko Osu & Mitsuo Kawato

Nat. Neurosci. 7, 1136–1143 (2004)

Because of a production error, some numbers were replaced by ## signs in Table 2 on page 1140. The corrected version appears below.

Table 2 Anatomical localization of differential brain activity from all experiments

Area	Hemisphere	Exp. 1: Discrete-Rhythmic					Exp. 2: DiscreteRest–RhythmicRest					Exp. 3: DiscreteSound–RhythmicSound				
		<i>x</i>	<i>y</i>	<i>z</i>	#	<i>t</i>	<i>x</i>	<i>y</i>	<i>z</i>	#	<i>t</i>	<i>x</i>	<i>y</i>	<i>z</i>	#	<i>t</i>
BA 10	Right	28	46	18	239	***8.79										
BA 47	Left	–44	17	–6	189	*** 9.64	–46	14	–1	196	*** 4.66	–44	17	–6	153	** 6.52
BA 47	Right	40	17	–3	406	***8.75										
BA 40	Left	–45	–44	47	514	*** 8.22	–50	–46	48	64	** 3.94	–44	–46	52	145	* 3.19
BA 40	Right	48	–36	47	489	***11.59										
		61	–33	31	513	***11.10										
BA 9 & BA 44	Left	–59	9	20	152	*** 9.03				0		–53	6	37	12	*** 4.18
BA 9 & BA 44	Right	50	15	25	187	***7.17										
BA 7	Left	–14	–67	51	92	*** 7.43	–12	–69	50	24	** 3.54	–14	–66	49	10	* 2.95
BA 7	Right	32	–63	51	493	***10.9										
BA 8	Right	53	14	40	248	***8.64										
Cereb. uvula	Left	–24	–69	–25	63	***6.74										
Cereb. culmen/tuber	Left	–40	–52	–29	463	***11.33										
Cereb. culmen/tuber	Right	40	–54	–29	150	*** 8.31				0		50	–54	–29	131	*** 5.99
PMdr	Left	–26	0	48	365	*** 11.35	–32	8	51	54	* 2.99	–36	1	55	414	*** 7.36
PMdr	Right	26	3	51	743	***14.45										
Pre-SMA	Left	–2	5	55	429	*** 11.88	–2	11	55	250	*** 4.62	–2	8	51	339	*** 13.63
Pre-SMA	Right	2	9	55	682	***11.95										
RCZp	Left	–2	12	43	223	*** 11.54	–2	25	34	135	*** 4.49	–4	14	45	369	*** 15.56
RCZa	Right	4	23	32	187	***9.43										
RCZp	Right	2	12	45	265	***12.09										

Area	Hemisphere	Exp. 1: Rhythmic-Discrete					Exp. 2: RhythmicRest–DiscreteRest					Exp. 3: RhythmicSound–DiscreteSound				
		<i>x</i>	<i>y</i>	<i>z</i>	#	<i>t</i>	<i>x</i>	<i>y</i>	<i>z</i>	#	<i>t</i>	<i>x</i>	<i>y</i>	<i>z</i>	#	<i>t</i>
CCZ/SMA	Left	–4	–11	54	134	*** 7.32	–2	–7	50	17	* 2.84	–2	–19	45	64	* 3.35
		–2	–21	42	99	*** 6.39						–10	–25	40	134	*** 5.10
Cereb. culmen	Right	22	–49	–16	633	*** 9.73	26	–51	–16	150	* 3.29	26	–47	–16	633	*** 9.39
M1/S1	Left	–38	–22	56	1021	*** 15.00	–34	–16	62	248	* 3.61	–38	–21	54	1019	*** 15.52

Localization was done using Cartesian *x,y,z* coordinates of the atlas of Talairach and Tournoux⁴³. #, number of 2 × 2 × 2 mm voxels in a cluster as determined by SPM at *P* < 0.05 (corrected for multiple comparisons for the volume of interest; see Methods). *t*, *t*-value (Student *t*-test) for the most activated voxel in a cluster. ****P* < 0.0001, ***P* < 0.005, **P* < 0.05. Owing partially to large cluster sizes (Figs. 2 and 3), brain coordinates between experiments seem to have more variance than was actually present, as it is highly random which voxel in such large clusters happens to be the most activated one. Rows in boldface type denote areas that are directly involved in the control of the right wrist: that is, the left cerebral and the right cerebellar hemisphere. In Experiments 2 and 3, we focused our analyses only on these regions. Abbreviations³⁰: CCZ, caudal cingulate zone; RCZ, rostral cingulate zone, consisting of anterior (RCZa) and posterior (RCZp) portions; SMA, caudal portion of the supplementary motor area, corresponding to SMA proper; pre-SMA, rostral portion of the supplementary motor area; M1, primary motor cortex; S1, primary sensory cortex; PMdr, rostral part of the dorsal premotor cortex; PMdc, caudal part of the dorsal premotor cortex; cereb., cerebellum; BA, Brodman area; BA 7, precuneus in parietal cortex; BA 8, middle frontal gyrus; BA 9, middle frontal gyrus; BA 10, anterior frontal lobe; BA 47, inferior frontal gyrus; BA 40, inferior parietal cortex; BA 44, Broca's area.