



T_H1 and T_H2 cytokine control of thyrocyte survival in thyroid autoimmunity

R. MIRAKIAN¹, L. J. HAMMOND¹ & G. F. BOTTAZZO

¹Department of Immunology, St Bartholomew's and Royal London Medical School, London EC1A7BE, UK. ²Scientific Directorate, Pediatric Hospital 'Bambino Gesù', Rome, Italy. (r.mirakian@mds.qmw.ac.uk)

Stassi *et al.*¹ have proposed that in thyroid autoimmunity thyrocyte survival depends on the differential effect of T_H1 and T_H2 cytokines. Their conclusion is based on the demonstration that the T_H2 cytokines IL-4 and IL-10, which are abundant in glands from patients affected by Graves' disease (GD) but not Hashimoto's thyroiditis (HT), are able to up-regulate expression of FLIP and of the anti-apoptotic gene that encodes Bcl-x_L on thyrocytes. *In situ*, both FLIP and Bcl-x_L are up-regulated in the thyroids of patients with GD but not HT. The up-regulation of these proteins would enable GD thyrocytes to become resistant to Fas-mediated apoptosis. The T_H1 cytokine IFN- γ , which is detected in HT thyroids, does not exert an effect on Bcl-x_L expression on HT thyrocytes. However, it can stimulate expression of caspase-8 and

caspase-3 on these cells, which leads to apoptosis.

There are two points we wish to address: both relate to our difficulty in reconciling these results¹ with previous findings in the literature. First, in previous reports, no differential pattern of T_H1 and T_H2 cytokine expression has been shown in different thyroid autoimmune glands²⁻⁵. Although it has been suggested that a functionally, rather than morphologically, dominant subset of T cells is critical for the pathogenesis of either destructive or stimulating thyroid autoimmunity⁶, clear documentation of a restricted T_H1- or T_H2-dependent profile has in general, remained elusive.

In particular, we have studied the expression of IL-10 in various thyroid conditions by reverse-transcribed polymerase chain reaction (RT-PCR), *in situ* hybridization and immunohistochemistry⁵ and found the following. (i) By RT-PCR high amounts of IL-10 were seen in 3/6 GD samples and in 1/2 HT samples. In 3/6 GD samples the amount of IL-10 found was similar to that found in the controls. (ii) By *in situ* hybridization IL-10 expression was observed within the most intense infiltrates (not within the thyrocytes) not only of GD but also of HT glands. (iii) High amounts of IL-10 expression were associated with earlier stages of disease

rather than with the severity of the lymphocytic infiltration. (iv) The highest amounts of IL-10 were present in 5/6 glands from autoimmune patients with the highest titers of circulating TPO antibodies, thus suggesting a role for this cytokine in B cell stimulation rather than in protecting against autoimmunity.

The second issue concerns the detection of "normal" amounts of Bcl-x_L expression on thyrocytes from thyroids affected by HT. Because it has been found that expression of another anti-apoptotic gene, which encodes Bcl-2, is decreased on thyrocytes taken from patients with this autoimmune-destructive condition^{7,8} and Bcl-x_L is more easily induced than Bcl-2, at least on lymphocytes⁹, we would have expected Stassi *et al.* to give an interpretation of their data in the light of these reports.

As autoimmune thyroid disease represents a broad spectrum of conditions with an extensive clinical overlap it is critical that one remains cautious when, from the results obtained in a small cohort of patients, hypotheses are formulated.

1. Stassi, G. *et al.* *Nature Immunol.* **1**, 483-488 (2000).
2. Paschke, R., Schuppert, F., Taton, M. & Velu, T. *J. Endocrinol.* **141**, 309-315 (1994).
3. Watson, P. F., Pickerrill, A. P., Davies, R. & Weetman, A. P. *Endocrinol. Metab.* **79**, 355-360 (1994).
4. Ajjan, R. A., Watson, P. F., McIntosh, R. S. & Weetman, A. P. *Clin. Exp. Immunol.* **105**, 523-528 (1996).
5. De La Vega, J. R. *et al.* *Clin. Exp. Immunol.* **113**, 126-135 (1998).
6. Roura-Mir, C. *et al.* *Eur. J. Immunol.* **27**, 3290-3302 (1997).
7. Hammond, L. J. *et al.* *J. Pathol.* **182**, 138-144 (1997).
8. Mitsiades, N. *et al.* *Endocrinol. Metab.* **83**, 2199-2203 (1998).
9. Mueller, D. L., Seiffert S., Fang, W. & Behrens, T. W. *J. Immunol.* **156**, 1764-1771 (1996).

Response

GIORGIO STASSI¹, ANTONELLA STOPPACCIARO², LUIGI RUCO² AND RUGGERO DE MARIA³

¹Department of Surgical, Anatomical and Oncological Sciences, Human Anatomy Section, University of Palermo, 90127 Palermo, Italy.

²Department of Experimental Medicine and Pathology, University of Rome "La Sapienza", Italy. ³Laboratory of Hematology and Oncology, Istituto Superiore di Sanità, 00161 Rome, Italy. (rdemaria@tin.it)

Mirakian *et al.* question our recent results, which suggest that thyrocyte survival during thyroid autoimmunity depends on differential effects of T_H1 and T_H2 cytokines¹. Thyrocyte destruction in autoimmune thyroiditis is a slow process that lasts several years. We hypothesized that in thyroid autoimmunity the balance between life and death in thyrocytes depends on the predominance over the time of T_H2 and T_H1 cytokines, whose action is not restricted to immune cells but involves direct modulation of key molecules responsible for survival or death of target cells¹.

As we discussed in our article, GD and HT are the two extremes of a wide clinical spectrum of thyroid autoimmunity that includes a series of mixed forms showing various degrees of tissue destruction. This heterogeneity may explain some conflicting results published in the literature.

However, before publishing our hypothesis¹, we analyzed cytokine expression in thyroid tissues from eight GD and eight HT patients. As described in our article, although the cytokine pattern is not "black and white", this analysis showed a clear prevalence of T_H2 cytokines in GD and T_H1 in HT¹ (and our unpublished data). These results were not published entirely because, considered in line with other published data^{2,3}, they were redundant.

Concerning the points specifically raised by Mirakian *et al.* in relation to their previous findings⁴, we have the following

comments. (i) In contrast to their data, IL-10 production has been clearly documented by others⁵ in thyroids from patients with GD and not in thyroids from control patients. (ii) Mirakian *et al.* found IL-10 expression only in 1/2 HT-affected thyroids⁴. (iii) In contrast to what they claim, Mirakian *et al.* have shown that IL-10 was present only in the thyroid of the HT patient with the longest duration of disease (6 years)⁴. (iv) The protective role of IL-10 in autoimmune thyroiditis has been demonstrated *in vivo*⁶.

Finally, we did not mention Bcl-2 in our article¹ because its overexpression in thyrocytes does not exert a clear protective effect during Fas-induced apoptosis in thyrocytes (our unpublished data).

1. Stassi, G. *et al.* *Nature Immunol.* **1**, 483-487 (2000).
2. Roura-Mir, C. *et al.* *Eur. J. Immunol.* **27**, 3290-3302 (1997).
3. Heuer, M., Aust, G., Ode-Hakim, S. & Scherbaum, W. A. *Thyroid* **6**, 97-106. (1996).
4. de la Vega, J. R. *et al.* *Clin. Exp. Immunol.* **113**, 126-135. (1998).
5. Watson, P. F., Pickerrill, A. P., Davies, R. & Weetman, A. P. *J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab.* **79**, 355-360. (1994).
6. Batteux, F., Trebeden, H., Charreire, J. & Chiochia, G. *Eur. J. Immunol.* **29**, 958-963. (1999).