

In reply—

.....

Our reasons for withdrawing the paper are the same as those that traditionally justify a withdrawal. There has been a breach of ethical standards, as the article was an inflammatory political manifesto poorly disguised as a scientific work. An admixture of politics and historical falsehood is inadvisable when in search of intellectual truth. For example, the authors state that “Israel...proclaimed independence in 1948 and started a war against Muslim Palestinians and other Muslim neighboring

countries.” It is common knowledge that Israel proclaimed its independence in accordance with the United Nations resolution of 29 November, 1947 and that the surrounding Arab (not Muslim) states took up arms in an attempt to prevent its establishment.

This non-peer-reviewed paper contained historical errors and inconsistencies, inadequate and misleading references and inaccurate maps. In our view, the genetic data were interpreted loosely when considering historical questions.

As guest editor, Arnaiz-Villena had the responsibility to uphold the journal’s integrity, quality and impartiality. It is our opinion that he violated this responsibility, forcing us to act so as to prevent *Human Immunology* and the American Society for Histocompatibility and Immunogenetics from becoming involved in disseminating scientific misinformation, historical distortions and political agendas.

Nicole Suciú-Foca

*Department of Pathology, Columbia University,
New York City, New York 10032, USA.*

*Correspondence should be addressed to N.S.F.
(e-mail: ns20@columbia.edu).*