

the disturbing impression that for the pure scientific mind no values exist: the true scientist can be happy even when coming close to mass murder. We hear, for example, about a conversation Lifton had with a psychiatrist who had treated members of the *Einsatzgruppen*. The killers had had nervous breakdowns, anxiety and feelings of guilt for their manual mass-killing of Jewish men, women and children alike. The German psychiatrist recalls how he succeeded in a relatively short time in riding his patients of their symptoms, particularly the anxiety feelings, and thus was able to send them back to the Soviet Union to kill more Jews. "Did you have anxiety dreams treating these men?" Lifton asked the psychiatrist. "No, I never killed anybody" was the answer.

In the last chapter, Lifton tries to outline the psychology of genocide, that is, the cultural conditions which may lead a people to become organized to commit mass murder. As much as I admire his analysis, I have to say that this is the least successful part of the book. Lifton has hardly read his original sources, almost always quoting them second-hand be they Luther, Goethe, Nietzsche or Max Weber: "Faust quoted as in Pinson" is unfortunately a typical reference in the Notes.

There are just two points where I have disagreements of substance. First, the Jews were not the only "race" on which genocide was planned; the Gypsies were persecuted just as severely. Secondly, I do not share Lifton's opinion that the treatment of "schizoid inmates" with electric shock in Auschwitz was "proper research". Other readers may have other criticisms because a large and detailed work such as this is bound to contain occasional mistakes, misprints and misjudgements. But they cannot detract from the fact that Lifton's book is a monumental achievement, which will for a long time be considered to be the definitive account of the psychology of the murderous Nazi doctors. It should be read carefully and fully — and it makes no easy reading — by any medical doctor or scientist. Above all, the question Lifton asks at the end should be asked and answered by all of us: "can we interrupt the process [of doubling leading to genocide] first by naming it?" □

Benno Müller-Hill is a Professor in the Department of Genetics, University of Cologne, D-5000 Cologne 41, FRG, and author of Deadly Science: The Elimination of Jews, Gypsies and the Mentally Ill, 1933-1945, published in German in 1984 by Rowohlt Taschenbuch Verlag.

• *The Policies of Genocide: Jews and Soviet Prisoners of War in Nazi Germany*, edited by Gerhard Hirschfeld and recently published by Allen & Unwin, is a collection of essays by five German historians on aspects of the systematic killing programme operated by the Third Reich. Price is hbk £18, \$22.95; pbk £5.96, \$9.95.

Blooming thistle

J.V. Golinski

A Hotbed of Genius: The Scottish Enlightenment, 1730-90. Edited by David Daiches, Peter Jones and Jean Jones. *Edinburgh University Press: 1986. Pp.160. Hbk £22.50; pbk £10.95.*

HISTORIANS have devoted much attention to the Scottish Enlightenment. During that intense burst of cultural activity, concentrated in the middle few decades of the eighteenth century, Scottish intellectuals made decisive contributions to fields as diverse as history and sociology, moral philosophy and aesthetics, psychology and epistemology, medicine and chemistry, agriculture and the fine arts. To explain such an intellectual supernova poses a considerable challenge. Was it all a reaction to shrugging off the straitjacket of Calvinist religiosity, or a consequence of the rapid urban and economic development of Scottish society, or a kind of displacement activity for an aristocracy deprived of its governing role after the 1707 Union with England? All these reasons have been suggested, and most probably all of them, and more, must be taken into account for a full explanation.

A Hotbed of Genius does not aim to arbitrate between the accounts of professional historians, but to offer non-specialists an opportunity to savour the climate of the times. To this end, it is extensively and tastefully illustrated, and informally written. David Daiches sets the scene in the first chapter, with a readable review of the Scottish Enlightenment as a whole. The strong interests of the Scottish thinkers in the historical development of their society and the cultural identity of their nation come through clearly; and attention is also devoted to the urban architecture in which they took such pride, and the clubs and societies of which they were so fond. Somewhat more speculatively, Archie Turnbull rounds off the volume with a discussion of possible Scottish influences on the founders of the United States. In between are four studies of leading individual figures of the movement: the philosopher David Hume, the political economist Adam Smith, the chemist Joseph Black and the geologist James Hutton.

Hume and Smith are the two towering geniuses of the Scottish Enlightenment, whose influence is still felt today, although their current reputations do little justice to the range of their concerns. Both men were philosophers in the best sense of the word, concerned with all the moral problems of human behaviour in a changing society, and committed to making pure thought directly relevant to practical action. To perceive the breadth of their

interests is to have one's admiration for them increased, and to begin to see them as men of their time. The articles by Peter Jones and D.D. Raphael have the virtue of helping us to do this.

It is pleasant to see the scientists Black and Hutton getting equivalent recognition; but the essays on them, by R.G.W. Anderson and Jean Jones, while giving well-informed surveys of their careers, do not so convincingly demonstrate their rootedness in their enlightened milieu. The connections which the men of the time saw between Enlightenment culture and the pursuit of chemistry, medicine, agriculture and geology are not explored



Enlightened chemist — Joseph Black, the discoverer of carbon dioxide and the principle of latent heat.

here, despite the fact that some recent scholarship has been devoted to illuminating them.

While specialists might carp at details, the general reader is likely to be delighted by this book, not least by its numerous illustrations, many of them in colour. The work of the portraitists Allan Ramsay and Henry Raeburn is rightly exploited to the full by the editors; and the rather weird caricatures of John Kay are also a considerable asset. Architectural and scenic drawings help us to envisage the surroundings in which these men lived and worked. In general, the large investment of the editors in visual material makes for rewarding browsing.

But there is sustenance here for readers as well as browsers. While its illustrations are likely first to draw the eye, the book's text should engage the reader and satisfy much of his curiosity. A coffee-table item perhaps, but with enough intellectual caffeine to stimulate even those to whom the Scottish Enlightenment is familiar ground. □

J.V. Golinski is a Research Fellow at Churchill College, Cambridge CB3 0DS, UK.