

fascicle of the temporalis muscle that arises from the infratemporal crista and the infratemporal spine of the sphenoid bone. In 1955 a detailed study of the origin, insertion and function of the temporalis muscle was published by W. Zenker<sup>7</sup>. He dissected cadaveric heads in both the frontal and horizontal planes and showed that the most medial attachment of this muscle extends over the maxillary surface of the sphenoid bone toward the foramen rotundum. It was named "the medial portion of the temporalis muscle." Other descriptions of the muscle including functional studies also exist (in German)<sup>5-6</sup>.

Times have changed. Whereas today the vast majority of research papers are published in English, this was not always the case — something we should remember when researching all fields but particularly those that were active so many years ago.

P. GROSCURTH

*Institute of Anatomy, University of Zurich  
Switzerland*

1. Dunn, G.F. *et al.* Anatomical observation of a craniomandibular muscle originating from the skull base: The sphenomandibularis. *J. Craniomandibular Pract.* **14**, 97–105 (1996).

2. Steele, F.R. Body of evidence supports new anatomical finding. *Nature Med.* **2**, 506 (1996).
3. Henle, J. *Handbuch der systematischen Anatomie*. 160, 171 & 173 (Friedrich Vieweg & Sohn, Braunschweig, 1871).
4. Poirier, P. & Charpy, A. *Traite d'Anatomie humaine*. Vol. I, 485 (Masson et Cie, Paris, 1901), Vol. II, 370 (1901).
5. Zenker, W. Ueber einige neue Befunde am M. temporalis des Menschen. *Z. Anat. Entwicklungsgesch.* **118**, 355–368 (1955).
6. Zenker, W. & Zenker, A. Zur funktionellen Anatomie des M. temporalis. *Dtsch. Zahn-Mund-Kieferheilkd.* **24**, 368–375 (1956).
7. Lang, J. *Klinische anatomie des Kopfes*. 104 (Springer Verlag, New York, 1981).
8. Schmidt, H.-M. *Kopf und Hals*, in *Benninghoff Anatomie*. Vol. I. (ed. Drenckhahn, D. & Zenker, W.) 509 (Urban & Schwarzenberg, Munich, 1994).

## Retrovirus-mediated p53 gene therapy

*To the editor* — We read with interest the report of partially successful retrovirus-mediated wild-type p53 gene therapy for lung cancer<sup>1</sup> and wish to draw attention to our own observations on the fate of retrovirally transduced wild-type p53 sequences.

p53-null mouse embryo fibroblasts were infected with a retrovirus expressing wild-type human p53, selected in puromycin and tested at regular intervals with a p53 functional assay that quantitatively measures mutant p53 RNA content<sup>2,3</sup>. Two days after infection we observed background values of mutant p53 content. The mutant content then rose rapidly with each passage, reaching 60–80% at passage five. The simplest explanation for this rapid counter selection of wild-type p53 expression is that RNA polymerase II and reverse transcriptase introduced mutations into the p53 in the virus and that cells transduced with these mutants have a significant survival or growth advantage. The fraction of input virus containing inactivating p53 mutations is difficult to infer from our data, but it could plausibly exceed 1% (ref. 4, 5). This is an irreducible mutant burden, and given the rapid selection of these mutants in our model system, the wisdom of using retroviruses for p53 gene therapy is questionable. Indeed, one predicted late side effect of introducing mutant p53 into large populations of normal cells would be to promote the development of new tumors through a transdominance mechanism.

We conclude that the use of retroviruses for any form of gene therapy where there is strong selection against

wild-type protein activity is unlikely to produce lasting benefit.

ANNE ESTREICHER & RICHARD IGGO

*Swiss Institute for Experimental  
Cancer Research (ISREC)  
1066 Epalinges, Switzerland*

*Roth replies* — The relevance of the model system used by Estreicher and Iggo to human cancer is questionable at best. The use of the easily transformed mouse embryo fibroblasts combined with puromycin selection would be expected to result in cells that inactivate p53 by mutation or deletion. Others have shown that when wild-type p53 is transfected into cells and those cells are placed under selective pressure, the few colonies that result are able to grow because of induced mutations in p53 (ref. 6).

However, the situation in studies of gene transfer *in vivo* and in clinical trials is quite different. Short-term expression of wild-type p53 is sufficient to induce apoptosis. Bystander effects also apparently contribute to amplified tumor cell death. Production of retroviral vectors expressing p53 has shown no accumula-

tion of transforming mutants as shown by an NIH 3T3 focus-forming assay or inactive vector preparations that would indicate overgrowth of retroviruses with mutant or deleted p53. Estreicher and Iggo should recall that p53 is a tumor suppressor gene and not a dominant oncogene. Its mutant form alone does not have transforming activity except for a very limited number of mouse cell lines<sup>7</sup>. Their observations also highlight the usefulness of *in vivo* experiments and clinical trials to assess safety and efficacy in the most relevant context.

JACK A. ROTH

*Thoracic and Cardiovascular Department  
M.D. Anderson Cancer Center  
1515 Holcombe Boulevard, Box 109  
Houston, Texas 77030, USA*

1. Roth, J.A. *et al.* Retrovirus-mediated wild-type p53 gene transfer to tumors of patients with lung cancer. *Nature Med.* **2**, 985–991 (1996).
2. Fiaman, J.M. *et al.* A simple p53 functional assay for screening cell lines, blood, and tumors. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **92**, 3963–3967 (1995).
3. Tada, M. *et al.* Clonality and stability of the p53 gene in human astrocytic tumor cells — quantitative analysis of p53 gene mutations by yeast functional assay. *Int. J. Cancer* **67**, 447–450 (1996).
4. Temin, H.M. Evolution of cancer genes as a mutation-driven process. *Cancer Res.* **48**, 1697–1701 (1988).
5. Flaman, J.M. *et al.* A rapid PCR fidelity assay. *Nucleic Acids Res.* **22**, 3259–3260 (1994).
6. Finlay, C.A., Hinds, P.W. & Levine, A.J. The p53 proto-oncogene can act as a suppressor of transformation. *Cell* **57**, 1083–1093 (1989).
7. Dittmer, D. *et al.* Gain of function mutations in p53. *Nature Genet.* **4**, 42–45 (1993).

## LETTERS TO THE EDITOR

*Nature Medicine* encourages letters to the editor. Priority is given to short (less than 500 words) and provocative letters on issues of the broadest interest to the biomedical research community. Letters should be addressed to *Nature Medicine*, 545 National Press Building, 529 14th Street NW, Washington, DC 20045, USA, or sent by fax (202.626.0970) or e-mail ([medicine@naturedc.com](mailto:medicine@naturedc.com)).